Volume 3, Issue 12



# Bel Horaah Ein horaah Slyryyeya

**Parshat Nitzavim Vayelech Zmanim for New York:** Candle Lighting: 6:58pm Shabbat ends: 7:57pm R"T 8:28pm

Shaare Ezra is a one of a kind, multi-faceted organization that's there for the community. Under the leadership of HaRav Shay Tahan שליט"א. Shaare Ezra feels that proper Halachic guidance should be accessible to everyone, therefore we offer the community the opportunity to call, text, WhatsApp, or e-mail any halachic questions they may have, through the

Bet Horaah, where qual-

ified, trained and or-

dained Rabbis are avail-

able to answer your

questions in English,

Hebrew and Russian.

Shaare Ezra is from the

community-for the

community.

Call/Text: 347-918-4088 WhatsApp: 347-666-3467 Email: askhalacha1@gmail.com Website: www.askhalacha.com Over 2,000 classes can be found at

Rabbishaytahan.com

Heartfelt appreciation and blessings extend to our generous donor for his unwavering and continuous support. May he and his family merit a year filled with health, success, and sweetness.

# THE LAST STRONGHOLD: SACRED PROFESSIONS RESISTANT TO AI WRITTEN BY RABBI SHAY TAHAN

\*TO RECEIVE THE WEEKLY NEWSLETTER PLEASE TEXT OUR HOTLINE 347-918-4088

sibility of a future where Al could potentially re- ers. place a substantial portion of jobs. A report by The Influence of Al on the Jewish Workforce Goldman Sachs suggests that AI has the potential Interestingly, perhaps one of the few work fields Sachs report, underscores the magnitude of po-fessions. Consider, for instance, the intricate

tential job displacement that AI could bring about.

To make it very clear, this transformation is not projected to anticipate in the distance future such as 20 or 30 vears from now; rather, it is expected to transpire in just a few short years,

as global powers compete in a race to achieve a ing animals, which may only be performed by a nance on a worldwide scale.

not mere speculation; it is a certainty that Al will Tzitzit, which necessitates the intention to fulfill soon replace a significant number of jobs.

breadth of sectors that could be influenced by intentions and thoughts renders them invalid. automation.

has the potential to make a substantial impact by brit milah, among various others. automating various tasks, potentially reducing the The resilience of these fields can be attributed to reliance on manual labor. Here's an illustration:

lyrics based on this analysis. This can reduce the need for human composers and lyricists in creatgles, or repetitive commercial tunes.

individual users or specific demographics, further these sacred practices. reducing the requirement for human composers Can machines prepare the Mitzvah items? to create customized music.

Additionally, Al-driven tools can automatically gen- authorities (poskim) grappled with their us-

The rapid and ongoing integration of AI (Artificial erate sheet music or transcriptions from audio Intelligence) across industries has raised the pos- recordings, simplifying the work of music compos-

to replace the equivalent of 300 million full-time worldwide that remains entirely impervious to jobs. This finding, highlighted by the Goldman automation is the domain of Jewish religious pro-

> tasks like inscribing sacred texts such as Sefer Torah, Tefillin, and Mezuzot. These items must be meticulously written by a Jewish sofer and cannot be substituted by any other means. Another example pertains to the intricate processes involved in slaughter-

breakthrough in intelligence that will exert domi- shochet possessing the requisite qualifications and intention.

Another crucial point to emphasize is that this is Similarly, the same applies to the preparation of the mitzvah of tzitzit. Furthermore, the craft of The impact of AI on work tasks is also a signifi- making Matza (shmura) for Pesach serves as ancant consideration. According to the Goldman other prominent example that must be carried out Sachs report, Al could replace up to a quarter of by a Jew with very specific thoughts in mind durwork tasks in the US and Europe, highlighting the ing the preparation process. The absence of these

There are numerous additional examples, includ-Consider the music industry as an example: All ing the blowing of the shofar and the practice of

two key factors. Firstly, those engaged in these Al-powered algorithms and machine learning professions must be observant Jews who adhere models can analyze vast amounts of music data, to Torah law. Secondly, they must infuse their including popular songs and trends. Al can gener- work with intention, particularly the intention reate original music compositions, melodies, and quired to prepare the mitzvah object "lishma," meaning solely for the purpose of the mitzvah. This level of dedication is a quality that Al lacks. ing music, especially for background music, jin- While artificial intelligence may display remarkable intelligence, it doesn't possess the spiritual Al can also personalize music composition for commitment and intention that are integral to

When machines were first invented, rabbinic



# THE LAST STRONGHOLD: SACRED PROFESSIONS RESISTANT TO AI

age in the preparation of mitzvah items, including the ones In contrast, Al systems, particularly those powered by machine this requires intention, which Al lacks. Some poskim, however, more flexible and dynamic manner.

argued that it's sufficient for the person to have the necessary intentions before initiating the machine, and when the machine begins preparing the items, it's considered as if it's done "lishma,"

The poskim derived this concept from the teachings of the Rosh, who maintained that it is permis-

the opposing view of the Rambam, who asserted that any in- of the person's will and intent. volvement of a gentile in the work would render the item unfit for a mitzvah.

guide a machine's operation by specifying that it should perform its task with the same lishma intent.

oncile with his wife, it does not appear that the gentile is writing it for the husband's benefit.

### Is Al less proficient than machines in the torah aspect?

Understanding the novelty of AI and how it differs from traditional machines is crucial for our discussion.

Al differs from traditional machines in terms of its ability to learn, adapt, and make decisions autonomously. Traditional machines operate based on pre-programmed instructions and repeat those instructions without deviation. They lack the capacity to learn from new data or experiences or to make independent decisions beyond their programmed parameters.

mentioned earlier. Numerous poskim maintained that ma- learning and deep learning algorithms, can analyze data, recchines are not valid for this purpose due to their inability to ognize patterns, and make predictions or decisions based on meet the two conditions we previously discussed; further- that data. Al can adapt and improve its performance over time more, they lack the capacity to prepare them "lishma" since as it encounters new information, allowing it to operate in a

Now, let's apply this perspective to Al:

On one hand, it can be argued that AI systems are tools or extensions created and controlled by humans. When a person employs AI to execute tasks or actions aligned with a mitzvah, they are essen-

sible to instruct a gentile to begin a task with the intent of tially guiding the AI to continue the task with the original lishfulfilling a mitzvah (lishma). This perspective contrasts with ma intent. In this sense, Al could be considered an extension

On the other hand, since AI represents a groundbreaking de-In accordance with this understanding, just as one may direct parture from conventional machines, it possesses the ability a gentile to perform an action lishma, similarly, one may also to learn, adapt, and make decisions autonomously, often resembling human cognitive processes. An opposing viewpoint suggests that Al's autonomous decision-making capacity sets However, the Chazon Ish clarifies that this principle applies it apart. It may not appear to perform tasks on our behalf in only when the person performing the task visibly appears to the same manner as traditional machines. According to the be doing it on behalf of the sender. In typical cases where teachings of the Chazon Ish, if it doesn't seem like the AI is there is no suspicion of a change of heart, the task is still con- acting for us, it may be considered invalid. In contrast to a non sidered lishma because it consistently appears as if it is being -Jew preparing on our behalf, where we have no reason to performed for the sender. For example, in the case of writing suspect a change from the original intention since they have a get, where the husband is likely to change his mind and rec- no motive to do so, AI continually learns and enhances itself. Consequently, one could argue that it doesn't appear as though it's performing our task.

> This presents a distinctive challenge when evaluating the validity of AI in the context of mitzvot. Even if someone may argue against the aforementioned assumption and assert that Al is equivalent to machines, there remains at least a level of doubt. Engaging in mitzvot with doubt is generally not permitted. Additionally, there is a disagreement (machloket) regarding the validity of mitzvot performed with machines, and most poskim maintain that they are not considered kosher.

### WISDOM IN REVIEWS: CHOFETZ CHAIM'S TIMELESS COUNSEL

As we commemorate the 90th yahrzeit (anniversary of pass- speech, primarily on social media platforms. ing) of the Chofetz Chaim, it is an opportune moment to reflect on his teachings and consider their relevance in ad-

Rabbi Yisrael Meir Kagan, also known as the Chofetz Chaim, was a renowned Jewish sage who lived during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. His groundbreaking work on the importance of guarding one's speech cannot be overstated. The Chofetz Chaim introduced the world to the significance of responsible communication and transformed the way people

dressing contemporary issues.

# Writing a Negative Review.

Let's address some common scenarios. For instance, is it permissible to write a negative review about a business or service provider, like a doctor or dentist? Is it permitted to write a negative review about a book you didn't like? Is it acceptable to write a fabricated positive review if the company offers rewards?

Let's begin with the dilemma posed by the first questions. On one hand, writing a negative review can po-

However, since the time of the Chofetz Chaim, technology has tentially harm the business owner and make them feel bad, rapidly advanced, and negative speech has taken on new which would fall under the restriction of lashon hara. On the forms. Today, we often encounter lashon hara, or harmful other hand, it may serve to inform others and potentially

# WISDOM IN REVIEWS: CHOFETZ CHAIM'S TIMELESS COUNSEL

business. So, where do we draw the line?

In his work "Pitchei Teshuva" (Chapter 156), Rabbi Yisrael Isser addressed the prevailing focus on the prohibition of la- Ensuring the review is accurate. shon hara. Nevertheless, he deemed it pertinent to shed light The second condition is to ensure that one accurately deon another aspect, one fraught with even greater moral re- scribes what happened in their review without any exaggerasponsibility and more commonly encountered. This pertains to tion.

individuals who refrain from revealing their neighbor's transgressions, even in situations of urgent necessity to safeguard an innocent party from harm. Their hesitation stems from the fear of violating the prohibition of lashon hara. For example, it could be someone who becomes privy to another person's secretive plot to harm their neighbor or

under the category of lashon hara. Rabbi Isser strongly assert- benefit. ed that those who act in this manner incur a more significant transgression than simply bearing this burden, as they violate No other available resolutions. the prohibition of 'You shall not stand idly by the blood of your The fourth condition is to ensure that there is no other reasonneighbor.' This principle also extends to financial matters, able way to resolve and improve the business's conduct. Of Whether one observes someone stealing from them, their ten, a direct conversation with the manager or addressing the resorting to deception and fraud in a transaction, or an individ-tify any wrongdoing. Most people inherently aim to provide ual lending money to a known dishonest debtor who will not good service and understand that satisfied customers lead to fulfill their obligations.

To address these questions, we can once again refer to the teachings of the Chofetz Chaim, who meticulously outlined the foundations of these prohibitions. By applying these principles. we can navigate our discussion.

### lashon hara letoeelet.

The Chofetz Chaim explains the concept of "lashon hara letoeelet," meaning lashon hara with a positive benefit, which is permitted. Such lashon hara is when our intention is to benefit the person we are speaking about, such as a teacher providing a negative report to parents to help the child improve, or when we aim to protect others from potential harm.

The Chofetz Chaim lays out five conditions that must be met to permit such lashon hara for a positive benefit.

# Verifying the situation is bad.

The first condition is that we should assess whether what happened was genuinely a negative occurrence or if it might be a Positive reviews. matter of our subjective viewpoint. It's crucial to recognize that When a business requests positive reviews, it's important to not every service falling short of our expectations should automatically be deemed as bad. Many products or services we behind the review is to express personal dissatisfaction rather centives like offering complimentary items. than to protect others.

Furthermore, writing a review for something you didn't like, views as biased and without any ulterior motives. such as a book or a meal at a restaurant, is subjective and may not necessarily reflect the opinions of others, as dif-

save them from having a similar negative experience with the ferent people have varied tastes. In contrast, when a business is found to be deceiving customers, the question of ethics and reviews becomes more relevant.



# The correct intention.

Thirdly, it is essential to have the intention of safeguarding others rather than seeking revenge for a negative service or encounter with the business. Often, negative reviews are written out of anger and frustration rather than a genuine desire to

who covertly prepares a hazard in their neighbor's home or protect others. The Chofetz Chaim emphasizes that engaging business. In such cases, they withhold crucial information or in such behavior, without a sincere intention to benefit or prodelay issuing warnings, guided by the belief that it might fall tect, is not in line with the permitted use of lashon hara for a

business partner engaging in embezzlement, their neighbor issue in person can lead to understanding and a desire to recmore business. Only after we have exhausted other means of protecting potential customers from harm through the business, and it is clear that there is no alternative, should we consider posting a negative review.

### Punishment fits the crime.

Finally, the last condition is that our warning to others should not cause the person more harm than merely protecting others from potential harm. In other words, if writing negative reviews could lead to consequences such as a person's children being denied admission to schools or fellow community members ceasing friendly interactions, we should refrain from posting such reviews. While we cannot always predict the full extent of the impact of our words, there are times when we have a strong indication of the potential consequences, and in such cases, we must exercise caution to avoid causing excessive harm.

recognize that this can be viewed as cheating, as others depend on your genuine experiences to make informed purchase encounter may still be deemed acceptable, even if they don't decisions. This remains true even if the review accurately refully meet our high standards. In such cases, it is generally not flects your personal opinion. This becomes particularly relepermissible to write a negative review because the intention vant when the business entices positive reviews through in-

The concern arises because readers may perceive such re-

This action also violates the prohibitions of 'הונאה' (deceit) and 'גניבת דעת' (misleading or deceptive behavior).

### **EMBRACING TESHUVA AND OVERCOMING DOUBTS**

the consequences (curses), and then turn to teshuva repent and live."

you—then you will take them to heart amidst the various nations to which Hashem has dispersed you, and you will return to Hashem and listen to His voice." The subsequent verses elaborate on the nation's complete repentance and improvement of their ways.

teshuva.

Then, (according to Ramban's explanation), the Torah proceeds with verses that emphasize to the people that they Rabbi Blazer explains that the key difference lies in the should not perceive repentance as something distant or unattainable: instead, it is readily accessible. It says not in heaven, for you to say: who can ascend to the heaven for us and take it, so that we can listen to it and perform it? Nor it is across the sea, for you to say: who can cross the other side of the sea for us to take it?"

The question that arises is: Why does the Torah need to make this point and assure them that repentance is within reach when the nation has already repented?

To gain deeper insight into this matter, let's reflect on an still harbored doubts regarding Hashem's capacity for for- ly and wholeheartedly. giveness. He conveyed Hashem's message, stating

In the middle of our parasha (Nitzavim), the Torah outlines (chapter 33):, "Do you truly think I desire the demise of the a prophetic scenario where the nation will sin, experience wicked? Absolutely not! My aspiration is for the wicked to

(repentance). It says (30,1), "When all these things come Rabbi Yitzchak Blazer (in the book "Kochvei Or," Article III) upon you—the blessing and the curse that I have set before raises an intriguing observation. He notes a contrast be-

> tween our contemporary era, where people have a strong belief in the power of teshuva to erase all sins, and the time of the prophet Yechezkel. In Yechezkel's time, even though the people were at a very high spiritual level. they struggled to fully embrace the concept of

understanding of the consequences of sin. In his time, people comprehended the severe damage caused by sin and (30,11): "For this commandment which I command you found it challenging to grasp how teshuva could rectify today- it is not hidden from you and it is not distant. It is such profound harm. Conversely, in our era, many individuals do not fully grasp the gravity of their transgressions, leading them to perceive teshuva as a simpler solution.

Now, returning to our parasha, the Torah predicts that the nation will indeed repent, primarily driven by their comprehension of the gravity of their sins and the harshness of their punishment. However, a new challenge emerges. Once they grasp the severity of their transgressions, doubt may creep in regarding the efficacy of their repentance. To episode involving the prophet Yechezkel, as he offered re- address this concern, the Torah proceeds to reassure them assuring words to people who had sincerely repented but that teshuva is attainable and effective when done sincere-



DO YOU LIKE THIS NEWSLET-TER? BE PART OF THE ZIKUI HARABIM!! DONATE TODAY TO HAVE A PART IN OUR GROWTH. BECOME A PARTNER FOR \$180 MONTHLY FOR 12 MONTHS! CONTACT 347-666-3467 TO **SPONSOR TODAY!** 



# **Dedications from our Partners**

LILUI NISHMAT HANUKA BEN YOSEF YOSOFOV **DAVID BEN ZOHOV** 

**REFUAH SHELEMA** ESTHER BAT MAZAL RACHAMIM BEN MIRIAM

REFUAH SHELEMA CHAIM YISROEL BEN TOVA RIVKA LAYA BAT BRACHA אילנה שיראן בת בתיה - שרה בתיה - שרה בת טובה

MAY HASHEM SEND SPECIAL STRENGTH IN TORAH AND ALL THE BERACHOT TO DAVID AKIVA AND RACHEL LEON.

Lev Mavashev from Alpha Realty Hatzlacha and Parnasa Tova. Hatzlacha to Moshe and Saritt Samechov