Practical Modern-Day Controversies In Hickory Vou have heard the shaylos . . . Now learn the issues & the opinions Teffiliation The Halchos of Kedushas Bais Hakneses – Part 2

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

b. Idle Talk

Last week we began our discussion of the halachos of Kedushas Bais Hakneses. We discussed how our Batei Keisios and Batei Medrashos are considered a mikdash me'at and has the holiness of a miniature Bais Hamikdash. This week, in Part 2, we will discuss the activities that are prohibited in a shul. Rav Moshe Shternbach¹ writes, "When one davens and learns torah in a Shul, the holiness remains there and is absorbed in the walls of the shul. Yet, if one speaks frivolous speech in a shul, these words too remain there and defile the holiness of the shul." Sefer Derech Moshe² writes that sadly, nowadays most people are careless regarding the holiness of the Batei Kneisios and talking idle speech in the Batei Kneisios have become as if it were permissible." Now, as we return to our shuls it is an opportunity to review the halachos of the Kedushas Bais Hakneses as they are stated in the Shulchan Aruch and Mishna Berura and at the same time attempt to justify some of the practices that we do in our Batei Keneisios and care to a realistic standard for ourselves in the area of Kedushas Bais Hakneses.

Activities that are Prohibited in a Shul

The Shulchan Aruch³ writes that certain activities are considered inappropriate and disrespectful, because our shuls are considered a *mikdash me'at.*⁴ One who performs these disrespectful activities in a shul violates the prohibition⁵ of "You shall fear my Sanctuary."⁶ The Shulchan Aruch⁷ writes that this prohibition applies to both a *Bais Hamedrash*. The Chafetz Chaim⁸ explains that when one does not show proper respect to a shul what he is doing is showing that he does not believe that *Hakadosh baruch Hu* resides in the shul. The Mishna Berura⁹ cites the *S'mak* that writes that because of the sin of not properly showing respect to a shul, the shul is turned into a house of idol worship. The requirement to show proper respect to a shul applies at all times - even when it is not in middle of davening.¹⁰ (However, the hallways and courtyard of a shul does not have kedusha and these restrictions do not apply there.¹¹)

The Shulchan Aruch¹² gives several examples of behaviors and activities that are not acceptable in a *shul*, because they are considered disrespectful to a *shul*:

- I) Frivolous activities
- 2) Eating and drinking
- 3) Sleeping
- 4) Using a Shul as a Shortcut

This week we will focus on the first prohibition, of performing frivolous activities in a *Bais Hakneses*.

I) Frivolous Activities

The Shulchan Aruch¹³ writes that it is prohibited to perform frivolous activities in a Bais Hakneses or a Bais Hamedrash. He gives two examples of frivolous activities: a) Joking and lightheadedness b) Idle speech. We will discuss these two categories.

a. Joking and lightheadedness

Acting jokingly and lightheadedly in a *shul* is inappropriate for the holiness of a *shul* and is therefore prohibited. For example,

- Sitting around and joking with friends in shul.¹⁴
- Watching humorous WhatsApp videos in a shul is considered an act of jokiness and lightheadedness.¹⁵
- Making calculations for business or checking up work emails in shul.¹⁶
- Reading a newspaper in a shul.¹⁷
- Some poskim¹⁸ write that in a shul one may not cross his legs one on top of another, as this is a show of haughtiness and is inappropriate in a shul.

The Shulchan Aruch¹⁹ writes that even idle talk is included in the prohibition of showing disrespect to a *shul*. The Zohar²⁰ writes strongly against talking in *shul*, "One who talks mundane speech in *shul*, woe is to him, for he shows that he does not have a portion in the G-d of the Jews, because he shows that he does not believe that the *Shechina* is found in the *shul*."²¹ The Ben Ish Chai²² explains that the Jewish people do not have an intermediary rather they speak directly with Hashem himself, this is indicative from the fact that the *Sechina* rests in a *shul*, someone who talk in shows that he does not believe that there is a direct relationship with Hashem. The Kaf Hachaim²³ writes that "if someone who talks idle speech in a *shul* it is better that he not come to *shul* at all. He is someone who sins and causes others to sin and causes the Satan to prosecute."²⁴ The prohibition of idle speech applies not only to the one speaking but to the one listening as well.²⁵

To clarify which speech is prohibited in a *shul*, we will discuss three types of speech: Idle speech that has no purpose, mundane speech that has a purpose, speech for a *dvar mitzvah*.

- I- Idle speech that has no purpose. The Shulchan Aruch²⁶ writes that in a shul, it is prohibited to speak idle speech that has no purpose (this applies even when the shul is built with a tenai, a condition, as we will later discuss). The Rambam²⁷ defines 'idle speech' as "the type of talk that is most common between people, such as discussing what happened or what is going to happen, or how the king of a certain country acted, or how a certain person died, or how a certain person became wealthy."
- 2- Mundane speech that has a purpose. There is a dispute among the poskim whether it is prohibited to speak in a shul mundane speech that has a purpose. For example, speech that is relevant for one's livelihood, or other productive speech. Some poskim²⁸ are lenient and do not consider purposeful speech to be disgraceful to a shul, while others²⁹ prohibit all mundane speech in a shul even if it is purposeful. The Mishna Berura³⁰ rules stringently that all mundane speech is prohibited in a shul, even if it is purposeful.³¹
- 3- Speech for a dvar mitzva. Obviously, one may daven and learn in a Bais Hakneses and a Bais Hamedrash.³² One may deliver a speech about divrei mussar and teshuva.³³ One may talk in a shul for other dvar mitzvos as well, as the Shulchan Aruch³⁴ rules "One may make calculations for a dvar mitzva in a shul, such as calculations for tzedakah,."³⁵ Similarly, one may greet his friend and say "Shalom Aleichem," because it is considered a mitzva.³⁶ If the situation calls for a more lengthy greeting, for example to someone who was away for a while, it may be permissible to extend a longer greeting so that he will not be offended, as this too is considered a mitzva.³⁷ Nevertheless, the Chaim³⁸ warns that "even when one speaks in a shul for a dvar mitzvah he should minimize his talk as much as possible, lest the permissible speech lead to prohibited speech."³⁹

To summarize: According to all opinions it is prohibited to speak idle speech that has no purpose (category one) in a *shul*. According to the Mishna Berura it is prohibited to speak any mundane speech in a *shul* even if it has a purpose (category two). We will soon attempt to rationalize why many are not careful with this prohibition.

Speaking lashon hara in a shul. The Mishna Berura⁴⁰ writes that "one must certainly be careful not to talk lashon hara and *machlokes* in a *shul*, because aside from the fact that these evil sins are severe, they are only magnified when spoken in *shul*, because they degrade the Presence of the *Shechina*. One cannot compare a sin done in private

I Teshuvos v'Hanhagos 1:158 2 Cited in kuntres Mikdash Me'at p. 49; Bais Yehuda 21:6 5 Vayikra 19:30 6 Sefer Chafetz Chaim, Introduction, Aseh 3 151:1; Mishna Berura 151:1 4 Mishna Berura 151:1 9 151:1 10 Bais Yehuda 1:3, as this is clear from all the poskim 7 151:1; as we mentioned earlier the holiness of a Bais Hamedresh is greater than that of a Bais Hakneses. 8 Sefer Chafetz Chaim, aseh 7 that these halachos are based on the holiness of the shul, and not the fact that people are davening. II See Bais Yehuda 20:21, note 39 citing several poskim. However, if one is standing in a hallway that is open to the entrance of the shul he should be careful not to act frivolously there, even though it is not considered a place that is kadosh (Bais Yehuda ibid, from Mishna Berura 154:3). **12** 151:1. The Shulchan Aruch discusses other examples as well such as beatifying oneself in a shul, entering a shul to protect oneself from the rain or the sun, making calculations in a shul (unless they are for a mitzva), making eulogies in a shul (unless it is for one of the great sages of the city or his family members). **13** 151:1 **14** The Shulchan Aruch (151:1) writes that "se'chok and hitul" is prohibited in a shul. Rav Chaim Kanievski (cited in Bais Yehuda 5:1, note 1) a moshav leitzim, of who the passuk (Tehillim 1) compares to wicked people. **16** See Shulchan Aruch 151:1 that it is prohibited to make calculations in shul unless it is for a mitzvah. The Biur halacha (151:1 d'h v'ein michashvin) explains that calculations in a shul is considered lightheadedness in a shul. Bais Yehuda (15:17, note 10) explains that included in this prohibition is performing any form of business in shul. 17 Bais Yehuda bild based on the Mor vKitzeiya. The Gerrer Rebbe, the Imrei Emes, would warn his chasidim not to bring newspapers (even newspapers that he felt were generally acceptable to be read) into the shul, saying that "the shul is intended for only learning Torah and davening." (cited in Piskei Teshuvos 276) 18 Yalkut Yosef 151:11 citing the Reishis Chacmah and the Ben Ish Chai 19 151:1 20 Teruma p.131b 21 As explained by Yalkut Yosef 151, footnote 4, explaining the Zohar 22 Ben Ish Chai (Vayikra, I) explaining the Zohar 23 151:8, citing the sefer Pesach Eiynayim 24 The Pri Megadim (151: Eishel Avraham I) writes that "if one sees another person talking idle speech in a shul, he should condern him." 25 Bais Yehuda 5:14 26 Shulchan Aruch 151:1(151:11); see Bais Yehuda 5:4 27 Peirush HaMishnayos (Avos 1:17), cited in kuntres Mikdash Me'att p. 30 28 Toras Chaim 151:6, d'h kasav hamagen Avraham 29 Pri Megadim 151: Eishel Avraham I 30 151:2 31 The Chafetz Chaim writes (end of Sefer Ahavas Chesed, Marginisa tavah 3) from the shule with the base of the set o Rabbeinu Yehonasan "One should not talk in a shul about worldly matters, even if they are very necessary." **32** See Bais Yehuda 7:1, note 1 regarding davening in a Bais Hamedrash or learning divrei mussar with an individual, however, it is ideal to deliver a speech of divrei mussar in a shul. 34 151:1 35 This includes speaking when making these calculations of a mitzvah as well (Bais Yehuda 7:2, note 4) 36 Elya Rabba 66:2. See however Gevuros Eliyahu (13:7, Rav Eliyahu Heinkin) who seems to say that giving Shalom in a shul is prohibited. 37 End of Sefer Ahavas Chesed, Marginisa tavah 3 from Rabbeinu Yehonasan 38 On Shabbos, when the holiness of the shul is even greater, there is even a greater obligation not to speak in shul anything other than Torah and Teffilah. (See Bais Yehuda 7:4, note 8 from many sefarim. The Zohar (Parshas Vayakhel) writes that "once Shabbos comes it is forbidden to speak about anything other than Torah and Teffila, not even needs of the Shul, and one who speaks other speech violates Shabbos. There are two angles that are charged with this, and when one speaks in shul on Shabbos they place their hands on his head and proclaim that he has no portion in the G-d of the Jews." 39 151:2 40 Megillah 28b

to a sin done in the palace of the King. Furthermore, he causes others to listen to lashon hara, and what begins as a few words of *lashon hara* quickly leads to arguments and *machlokes*, until the entire *Bais Hakneses* becomes a great burning furnace. And it is certainly the one who initiated the prohibited speech who is responsible for all this sin and destruction. He will receive the brunt of the punishment! Therefore, anyone who fears the word of Hashem will be vigilant not to speak any idle speech in a *Bais Hakneses* or *Bais Hamedrash*, and he will be careful to designate these places for only *torah* and *tefilla*."

Building a Bais Hakneses with a Tenai

The Gemara⁴¹ states that the *Batei Kneisios* in Bavel were made with a tenai,⁴² a condition, which states that their *shuls* do not attain the full level of holiness of a complete *Bais Hamedresh*.⁴³ The Gemara adds that even if a *tenai* is made the *shul* still has a level of holiness and one may not act frivolously in the *Bais Hakneses*. The *Rishonim* debate to what extent a *tenai* effectively minimizes the holiness of the *Bais Hakneses*. There are two main opinions:

Opinion #I – Tosfos: A tenai helps only after the Bais Hakneses is destroyed The opinion of Tosfos⁴⁴ is that a *tenai* is effective only for after the Bais Hakneses is destroyed. Meaning, that although the ground of a Bais Hakneses generally retains its holiness even after the Bais Hakneses is destroyed, if one made a *tenai* at the time the *shul* was built, the holiness does not remain after the Bais Hakneses is destroyed. However, according to Tosfos, a *tenai* is not effective while the Bais Hakneses is erect and being used, because a Bais Hakneses is inherently a holy place and one cannot make a condition to remove its holiness.⁴⁵ The Shulchan Aruch⁴⁶ follows the opinion of Tosfos, and states that "a *tenai* is only effective for after a Bais Hakneses is destroyed, not while it is erect and in use.".

Opinion #2 - Ramban: A tenai helps when there is a time of need

The opinion of Ramban⁴⁷ is that a *tenai* helps even while the Bais Hakneses is active and being used, but only when there is a great need, such as allowing poor people to eat and sleep in the shul. A Bais Hakneses that is built with a *tenai* is setup initially with a lower level of holiness which permits certain activities to be performed when there is a great need.⁴⁸ The Mishna Berura⁴⁹ writes that one may rely on this opinion.⁵⁰

Frivolous activities and idle speech. All opinions agree that even if a *tenai* is made it is prohibited to perform frivolous activities in a *shul*, as the Gemara states "even if a *tenai* is made one may not act frivolously in the *Bais Hakneses.*" Accordingly, the Mishna Berura⁵¹ writes that even if a *tenai* is made it is still prohibited to speak idle speech (and certainly *lashon hara*) in a *shul*, because speaking idle speech in a *shul* is considered a frivolous act.⁵²

If someone comes over to schmooze. The Peleh Yoetz⁵³ writes "There are some people who wish to be careful not to speak idle talk in the *Bais Hakneses*, but when people come over to speak to them they feel uncomfortable not to answer them as it seems to appear that they are acting condescendingly. They therefore begin to speak in *shul* with a broken heart until he too begins to think that talking in *shul* is permissible. Accordingly, someone who fears the word of Hashem should be taken by the severity of this sin and if someone comes to talk with him in *shul*, he should state clearly that he does not speak in a *Bais Hakneses.*"⁵⁴ Rabbeinu Yona⁵⁵ warns that one should be careful (as much as possible) not feel as if he is superior than others for not speaking in *shul*, for one who has feelings of superiority loses almost all of his reward."

Why are many people not careful regarding speaking idle talk in *shul*? The Aruch Ha*Shul*chan⁵⁶ observes, "I wonder how nowadays it has become commonplace that after davening is finished, people remain and freely speak idle speech in a *Bais Hakneses* and a *Bais Hamedrash*, to the point that it appears that it has become as if it is permissible." There are three basic approaches given to justify these practices:

I. A little socializing is a need. The Aruch HaShulchan⁵⁷ tries to justify why people speak idle talk in *shul* as follows: "It appears to me that people are relying on the opinion of the Ramban, that a *tenai* is effective even when the *Bais Hakneses* is being used when there is a great need, such as allowing poor people to eat and sleep in the *Bais Hakneses*. We must consider the purposeful conversing that people have with each other to be a need and is therefore permissible in the *shul*." Although the Mishna Berura⁵⁸ rules that speaking mundane speech in *shul* even when a *tenai* is made),⁵⁹ a minimal amount of conversing can be considered an important need.

2. "Talmidei Chachamim and their students." The Shulchan Aruch⁶⁰ writes that "talmidei chachamim and their students may eat and drink in a shul."⁶¹ The Aruch haShulchan⁶² explains that this includes "someone who spends the entire day or half of the day learning in the Bais Hamedresh." For example, someone learning in kollel or a yeshiva student may eat and drink in a Bais Medresh.⁶³ Someone who learns in a Bais Medrash for an hour or two does not fall into this category and may not use this leniency.⁶⁴ Nevertheless, the Mishna Berura⁶⁵ explains even a talmid chacham may not act frivolously in a Bais Hamedresh, as "certainly they may not act jokingly or speak idle speech in a Bais Hamedresh, for just because they are talmidei chachamim why should they not also be obligated in the mitzvah of showing respect to the mikdash (me'at)?"66 However, some poskim⁶⁷ justify those who spend their entire day learning in the Bais Hamedrash and need to speak mundane conversations that our important and cannot be deferred for a different time based on this leniency. They argue that just as talmidei chachamim may eat and drink n the Bais Hamedrash they may have these necessary conversations as well. (Some poskim68 do agree with this leniency as they argue that even talmidei chachamim are required go outside of the Bais Hakneses to have these conversations, because one can easily go outside the Bais Hamedrash to have these conversations.) Aside from the prohibition of kedushas Bais Hakneses, talking mundane speech often violates the severe prohibition of bitul torah.69

3. Our Shuls are not Batei Keneisios, but "a place of gathering." The Divrei Chaim⁷⁰ explains that our shuls are built with a special *tenai*, different then the *tenai* discussed in the Shulchan Aruch. It is a condition that states that the shul will not be categorized as a Beis Hakneses but a "place of gathering" where people come to daven and learn. It therefore has no kedushas Beis Hakneses and is not considered a mikdash me'at,⁷¹ and it is thus permissible to speak idle speech there.⁷² Some explain that Shteiblach ("a small room") were purposely given their name in order to indicate that it was not built with kedushas Beis Hakneses but as a mere "room" meant for people to daven and learn.⁷³ (Some⁷⁴ question this approach, because many shuls clearly name themselves a "Bais Hakneses" or "Bais Hamedrash," either on their buildings or their stationary, which clearly indicates that they are built as a mikdash me'at and not merely a "place of gathering.")

In Conclusion

The Shulchan Aruch rules that because our shuls are considered a *mikdash me'at* one must treat them with proper respect. This includes not performing frivolous activities or speaking idle speech in a *shul*. There are several approaches given as to why many are not careful not to speak mundane speech in a *Bais Hakneses*, yet there are certain forms of speech that are not appropriate in a *Bais Hakneses* according to all opinions.

1) Joking and frivolousness and certainly *lashon hara* are not appropriate in a *shul* even when built with a *tenai* and (in addition to the prohibitions involved with these forms of speech) violates the prohibition of *kedushas Bais Hakneses*.⁷⁵

2) Talking during davening is certainly prohibited, even if a shul is built with a *tenai*, and (in addition to the prohibition of talking during davening) doing so also violates the *kedushas Bais Hakneses*.⁷⁶

3) One should be careful to keep speak only mundane speech that are necessary and avoid speaking idle conversations. Keeping one's conversation to a minimum is a show of respect to the *Bais Hakneses.*⁷⁷

41 The Shulchan Aruch (151:11) writes that this trai must be made at the time that the shul is built. However, the Mishna Berura (151:32) cites a machlokes whether in Chutz la'Aretz one must explicitly speak out the tenai when building a shul, or can we assume that all shuls in Chutz la'Aretz are automatically built with a tenai. The Sha'arei Tzion writes that l'chatchila it is not worthwhile to be lenient on this issue. 42 The Shulchan Aruch (151:11) writes that this tenai works only in Chutz la'artez but is not effective at all in Eretz Yisroel. The Mishna Berura (151:37) explains that this is because the holiness of the shuls in Eretz Yisroel always remain, but the holiness of the shuls in Chutz la'aretz will leave them when Mashiach comes. [Perhaps, although the Gemara states that when Mashiach comes the shuls in Chutz la'aretz will travel to Eretz Yisroel, Rav Moshe Shternbach (Teshuvos v'Hanhagos 1:117) explains that this does not mean that the bricks of the Bais Hakeneses will travel to Eretz Yisroel, but the holiness that accumulated in the Shul from the words of teffilah and torah, will leave the Shul and travel to Eretz Yisroel.] See Biur halacha 151:11 d"h aval. 43 The Shulchan Aruch (151:11) writes that this tenai works only in Chutz lo'artez but is not effective at all in Eretz Yisroel. The Mishna Berura (151:37) explains that this is because the holiness of the shuls in Eretz Yisroel always remain, but the holiness of the shuls in Chutz la'aretz will leave them when Mashiach comes. [Perhaps, although the Gemara states that when Mashiach comes the shuls in Chutz la'aretz will travel to Eretz Yisroel, Rav Moshe Shternbach (Teshuvos v'Hanhagos 1:117) explains that this does not mean that the bricks of the Bais Hakeneses will travel to Eretz Yisroel, but the holiness that accumulated in the Shul from the words of teffilah and torah, will leave the Shul and travel to Eretz Yisroel.] See Biur halacha 151:11 d'h aval. 44 Megillah 28b d'h v'af al pi 45 Rav Moshe Feinstein (Igros Moshe O.C. 2:44) explains that this is considered being masneh al mah shekasuv ba'torah, making a condition against what the Torah states. 46 [51:1] 47 Megillah 26b d'h v'ha 48 Rav Moshe Feinstein (Igros Moshe O.C. 2:44) 49 Biur Halacha 151:11 d''h aval b'yishuvo 50 Rav Moshe Feinstein (Igros Moshe 1:45) There is a third opinion cited in the Biur Halacha (ibid), the opinion of Rashi, that when one makes a tenai it is effective even when the shul is in use and even if it is not great need. However, even according to this opinion one may not perform frivolous activities that are degrading to the shul (Biur 51 Mishna Berura in Sha'ar HaTzion 151:20; see Bais Yehuda 19:6 (note 21) where he explains that according to all opinions idle speech is prohibited even when a tenai is made. 52 Halacha, ibid). According to the Shulchan Aruch 151:15 53 Siman on Bais Hakeneses (cited in Bais Yehuda 5:6, note 7) 54 Regarding someone who comes over to discuss mundane speech that has a purpose, which according to some opinions mentioned earlier it is permissible to be spoken in a shul, many poskim write that although the Mishna Berura rules stringently that one should not speak such mundane speech in a Bais Hakeneses, nevertheless if there is a possibility that the person will be slighted one may answer him since there are opinions that rule that such speech is permissible in a Bais Hakeneses. (See Bais Yehuda :12, note 18) 55 Sefer Hayira 96 (cited in Bais Yehuda 5:7, note 11) 56 151:5 57 151:5 58 Mishna Berura in Sha'ar HaTzion 151:20 59 See Bais Yehuda, p.223, 224 where he questions this leniency based on this issue. 60 151:1 61 See Rema, where he makes a distinction between a *Bais Hakneses* where they may only eat there if there is a great need, and a *Bais Hamedresh* where they may always eat there. 62 151:5 63 Bais Yehuda 8:5 64 Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv, cited in Bais Yehuda 17:4, note 7 65 151:6 66 However, some justify what seems to be the custom of speaking mundane speech based on the fact that someone who spends his day in the Bais Hamedrash may speak necessary conversations just as he may eat and drink there (Misgeres Hashulchan, on the Kitzur Shulchan Aruch 13). See Bais Yehuda 5:9, note 15, where he also brings this from Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv. However, the Bais Yehuda cites others that do not agree with this leniency. 67 Misgeres Hashulchan, on the Kitzur Shulchan Aruch 13). See Bais Yehuda 5:9, note 15, where he also brings this from Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv 68 Mishnas Yosef 29:5; Rav Aryeh Leib Shteinman and Rav Nissim Karetetz (cited in Bais Yehuda 5:10, note 16) 69 Bais Yehuda 5:11 70 Choshen Mishpat, 32 71 Rav Moshe Feinstein Igros Moshe O.C. 2:44 72 Lhoros Nassan 1:6:10 73 Lhoros Nassan ibid; Gevuros Eliyahu, 43:2 [However, Rav Eliyahu Heinkin rules that such a tenai is not effective to permit frivolous activities.] 74 Mishnas Yosef, 28 (cited in Bais Yehuda, 75 Mishna Berura 151:2; Sefer Chafetz Chaim, Introduction aseh 7 76 L'horos Nassan 1:6:11 77 See Aruch Hashulchan 151:5 that the justification to speak in shul is since they are considered p.223) "a need." Accordingly, the more one can minimize these conversations the more honor one accords to the Bais Hakneses.