

# The Dee Pirkei Avot Project

Dedicated  
to those who have tragically been murdered,  
for the safe return of those missing or held hostage,  
for the refuah of those injured,  
the continued strength and bravery of our chyalim in the IDF  
and safety of all those in our homeland of Israel.

**כָּל מַחְלֶקֶת שֶׁהִיא לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, סוֹפָה לְהִתְקַיֵּם. וְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, אֵין סוֹפָה לְהִתְקַיֵּם. אֵיזוֹ הִיא מַחְלֶקֶת שֶׁהִיא לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, זֶה מַחְלֶקֶת הַלֵּל וְשַׁמַּי. וְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, זֶה מַחְלֶקֶת קָרַח וְכָל עֲדָתוֹ:**

Every argument that is for [the sake of] heaven's name, it is destined to endure. But if it is not for [the sake of] heaven's name -- it is not destined to endure. What is [an example of an argument] for [the sake of] heaven's name? The argument of Hillel and Shammai. What is [an example of an argument] not for [the sake of] heaven's name? The argument of Korach and all of his congregation.

Mishna 5:17 teaches that disputes are inevitable. They are a condition of our human nature. There are, however, good disputations: "for the sake of Heaven" and bad disputations: "not for the sake of Heaven." It is through understanding this Mishna that we learn to distinguish between a good dispute, to be pursued and a bad dispute, to be avoided.

Disputes for the "sake of Heaven", where the purpose and intention is for the search of the Divine truth, are destined to endure and stand the tests of time. Such debates yield benefits and contribute positively to individuals and situations. A notable example of such disputes were those between the schools of Hillel and Shammai, which exemplified how debates should be framed – in the quest for truth. Rabbi Jonathan Sacks zt'l in his book Arguments for the Sake of Heaven explains how Jewish tradition encourages constructive and respectful disagreement, to foster growth and development. This is further exemplified through Rabbinic texts, such as the Gemara, that explores diverse ideas and perspectives, recognising alternative viewpoints within Judaism in the quest for truth. Rabbi Sacks explains that collaborative debates, even confrontational ones, benefit all involved, as discovering truth is the ultimate outcome. Even losing an argument is valuable, as it enhances understanding and knowledge within the community.

This can be contrasted with debates that are not conducted for the sake of Heaven, where its purpose is not to positively seek out the truth but rather for the sake of victory - to pursue something of self-interest or self-gain. In such cases, attempting to achieve power leads the individual to disconnect himself from Hashem, which lacks enduring value and has no benefit to anyone involved - the aim is to simply defeat the opponent. A poignant example is how Korach argued with Moshe out of a desire to win a personal victory.

Korach's self-serving motives – trying to achieve power and lacking any essence of a higher purpose, ultimately resulted in his downfall, symbolised by the ground opening up and swallowing Korach. This Mishna emphasises the importance of purpose and intention when having debates or discussions, suggesting that those aimed at achieving greater truths or understanding are more likely to have lasting value.

#### Discussion Questions:

Can you think of an example of a debate that is for the purpose of seeking out the truth? If so, in what way did this create a benefit?

How can the principles derived from this Mishna be applied to contemporary disputes or debates?

Are there modern examples that reflect disputes for the sake of Heaven' verses those that do not?

Idea by Eliana Brodie

לעילוי נשמת:

לאה בת רפאל הכהן וציפורה

מאיה אסתר בת הרב אריה מרדכי ולאה

רינה מרים בת הרב אריה מרדכי ולאה



# The Dee Pirkei Avot Project

Dedicated  
to those who have tragically been murdered,  
for the safe return of those missing or held hostage,  
for the refuah of those injured,  
the continued strength and bravery of our chyalim in the IDF  
and safety of all those in our homeland of Israel.

**כָּל מַחְלֶקֶת שֶׁהִיא לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, סוֹפָהּ לְהִתְקַיֵּם. וְשֵׁאִינָהּ לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, אֵין סוֹפָהּ לְהִתְקַיֵּם. אִיזוּ הִיא מַחְלֶקֶת שֶׁהִיא לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, זוּ מַחְלֶקֶת הַלֵּל וְשַׁמַּיִ. וְשֵׁאִינָהּ לְשֵׁם שָׁמַיִם, זוּ מַחְלֶקֶת קָרַח וְכָל עֵדָתוֹ**

Every argument that is for [the sake of] heaven's name, it is destined to endure. But if

it is not for [the sake of] heaven's name -- it is not destined to endure. What is [an example of an argument] for [the sake of] heaven's name? The argument of Hillel and Shammai. What is [an example of an argument] not for [the sake of] heaven's name?

The argument of Korach and all of his congregation.

Mishna 5:17 teaches that disputes are inevitable. They are a condition of our human nature. There are, however, good disputations: "for the sake of Heaven" and bad disputations: "not for the sake of Heaven." It is through understanding this Mishna that we learn to distinguish between a good dispute, to be pursued and a bad dispute, to be avoided.

Disputes for the "sake of Heaven", where the purpose and intention is for the search of the Divine truth, are destined to endure and stand the tests of time. Such debates yield benefits and contribute positively to individuals and situations. A

notable example of such disputes were those between the schools of Hillel and Shammai, which exemplified how debates should be framed – in the quest for truth. Rabbi Jonathan Sacks zt'l in his book Arguments for the Sake of Heaven explains how Jewish tradition encourages constructive and respectful disagreement, to foster growth and development. This is further exemplified through Rabbinic texts, such as the Gemara, that explores diverse ideas and perspectives, recognising alternative viewpoints within Judaism in the quest for truth. Rabbi Sacks explains that collaborative debates, even confrontational ones, benefit all involved, as discovering truth is the ultimate outcome.

Even losing an argument is valuable, as it enhances understanding and knowledge within the community.

This can be contrasted with debates that are not conducted for the sake of Heaven, where its purpose is not to positively seek out the truth but rather for the sake of victory - to pursue something of self-interest or self-gain. In such cases, attempting to achieve power leads the individual to disconnect himself from Hashem, which lacks enduring value and has no benefit to anyone involved - the aim is to simply defeat the opponent. A poignant example is how Korach argued with Moshe out of a desire to win a personal victory. Korach's self-serving motives – trying to achieve power and lacking any essence of a higher purpose, ultimately resulted in his downfall, symbolised by the ground opening up and swallowing Korach. This Mishna emphasises the importance of purpose and intention when having debates or discussions, suggesting that those aimed at achieving greater truths or understanding are more likely to have lasting value.

### Discussion Questions:

Can you think of an example of a debate that is for the purpose of seeking out the truth? If so, in what way did this create a benefit?

How can the principles derived from this Mishna be applied to contemporary disputes or debates?

Are there modern examples that reflect disputes for the sake of Heaven' verses those that do not?



Idea by Eliana Brodie

לעילוי נשמת:

לאה בת רפאל הכהן וציפורה

מאיה אסתר בת הרב אריה מרדכי ולאה

רינה מרים בת הרב אריה מרדכי ולאה





**Missing or Held Hostage:**

Itai ben Michal Zipporah  
 Rivka Levy  
 סביון חן בת רבקה  
 רינת זגדון  
 אביה בת יפעת  
 Sharona shmunis harel  
 Itai zamir  
 Ben Menashe Ben Dikla  
 יובל בוים  
 ענר אליקים בן שירה  
 אליסף בן פורת , גבריאל בראל  
 Gal Navon (Gal Ben Naama)  
 עווד בן בלהה , יוכבד בת לאה  
 אבינתן בן דיצה תרצה  
 Ben Shimoni  
 הירש בן שרה  
 אבינתן בן דיצה תרצה  
 מיכאל בן רחל  
 עילי עזר בן אפרת  
 עידן אלכסנדר בן יעל  
 נריה בן שרון  
 מוריה בת סנדרה  
 יהונתן בן לימור  
 דביר חיים בן רוית  
 הדר בת גליה  
 אליהו בן בת שבע  
 בועז מנשה בן עטרה  
 אלקנה בוחבוט בן רוחמה  
 שגיא בן נעמית  
 דור בן דורית  
 תומר שגב  
 אברהם בן רפאל  
 אורי בן סיגלית  
 אוריאל ביבי בן יעל ג'וליה  
 אושר בן רחל  
 איתמר בן מיכל  
 רינת הודיה בת מיכולה  
 הירש גולדברג פולין  
 Adi Margalit bat Elka Chana  
 עומר מקסים בן אורנה אסתר ורון  
 doreen attias bat tali  
 אופיר אנגל  
 נעמה בת איילת  
 איתי בן חגית  
 תמיר בן חרות  
 שגיא בן נעמית  
 Matan ben Anat

Ada bat Esther  
 Adi bat Shoshan  
 Adina bat Eida  
 Agam Ben Chen  
 Alma bat Yonat  
 Amelia bat Daniella  
 Avigail bat Smadar  
 Aviva bat Golit  
 Chana bat Jesse  
 Chana bat Rivka  
 Chen bat Giora  
 Clara bat Tanya  
 Dafna bat Maayan  
 Danielle bat Rivka  
 Ditzza bat Leah Heiman  
 Doron Bat Efrat  
 Eitan ben Batsheva  
 Ella bat Maayan  
 Elma bat Leah  
 Emma bat Sharon  
 Emily bat Narkis  
 Erez Ben Hadas  
 Gal Ben Chen  
 Gavriela bat Tanya  
 Hagar Brodetz  
 Hila bat Raaya  
 Karina bat Eera  
 Keren bat Rut  
 Margalit bat Lita  
 Maya bat Gavriella  
 Maya bat Mirit Regev  
 Meirav bat Rachel  
 Mika bat Karina  
 Naveh ben Adi  
 Noam bat Sharone  
 Noam ben Yonat  
 Noga bat Shiri  
 Ofelia bat Rosinta  
 Ofry bat Hagar  
 Ohad Ben Keren  
 Or ben Renana  
 Ori ben Hagar  
 Rimon bat Avital  
 Roni ben Marina  
 Ruth bat Chedva  
 Sahar bat Hadas  
 Sharon bat Rivka  
 Sharon bat Ruti  
 Shiri bat Tamar  
 Shoshan bat Rina  
 Tal Ben Chen  
 Tamar Metzger  
 Yaffa bat Tova  
 Yagil ben Renana  
 Yahel Neri bat Adi  
 Yuli bat Sharon  
 Yuval ben Karina  
 Yuval Ben Hagar

**L'ilui Nishmat:**

אריאל בן אחיה ועידית אליהו הי"ד  
 רועי ויזר  
 רועי חיים בן נעמי וישראל  
 תומר בן מיכל  
 Yishai ben Yitzchak  
 Avraham Ben Yaffa  
 חנן (חנניה) בן יולנדה  
 יונתן צור בן רבקה  
 Nathanel Abraham Shalom ben Nahoum Maimon  
 ישי בן ענבל  
 רועי חיים בן ישראל מאיר ונעמי  
 אור מלכה  
 Ro'ee Ben yaron  
 אריה בן דבורה  
 Sgt. Roey Chaim Ben Yisrael Meir  
 מתן בן מירי וארז  
 רועי חיים בן נעמי וימי  
 אריאל בן אחיה ועידית  
 יוסף מרדכי בן דינה  
 אלחנן קלמנזון  
 אריאל בן עידית ואחיה  
 דביר חיים בן ישראל עמיחי  
 יוסף מלאכי בן דינה ודוד  
 דביר חיים בן ישראל עמיחי  
 יהונתן אהרון שטינברג  
 Paul Kessler  
 Sharona shumnit harel  
 אלחנן אריאל בן יהודה הי"ד  
 Elisheva Rose Ida Lubin  
 לורן בת חוה  
 אוריה בן ריטה  
 Daniel Shimon ben Doron  
 Zecharia Pesach ben Aharon Baruch  
 ilan Cohen  
**Refuah:**  
 יונתן צבי בן שרון  
 מיחי שמעון בן בתיה  
 איתי בן לוי  
 מיכאל בן אסתר  
 יאיר בן דרורה  
 נתנאל בן חיה אסתר  
 עמיחי שמעון בן בתיה  
 יאיר יונה בן דרורה ציפורה מלכה  
 Kinneret D  
 Hadar bat Galiya  
 ענר שפירא  
 Natalie  
 בת יהודית and יהודית בת תמר  
 נועה בת עדי מרציאנו  
 נבו בן מירב  
 דביר בן אורית  
 יונה בצלאל בן חוה שושנה  
 Shlomo Yair Chaim Ben Gittle Sara  
 רז בן דליה  
 Yonatan tzvi Ben Sharon  
 Nadav Ephraim Ben Shulamit Leah  
 יאיר בן דרורה

These lists are not comprehensive and only include names sent by people connected to this project. We pray for the welfare of those released from captivity (who may be in the hostage list). May our learning be in the zechut of ALL those in need in Israel.