Practical Modern-Day Controversies

In Hilchos You have heard the shaylos ... Now learn the issues & the opinions Shahos

When Purim Falls out on Friday

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

When Purim falls out on Friday, as it does this year, all of the *mitzvos* of Purim apply as they do on a regular year. One must be conscientious of the fact that there is less time than usual to fulfill all of the mitzvos of the day and must be careful to leave enough time to fulfill all of the mitzvos. What becomes more complicated on this Purim is the correct way to fulfill the Purim seuda without compromising one's Shabbos Seuda. In this chapter, we will discuss the different approaches in the *poskim* on the ideal way to fulfill the Purim Seuda this year.

A more meaningful Purim Sueda

At first glance, it appears, that the meaningfulness of the Purim Seuda is lessened on a year when Purim falls out on erev Shabbos as it is somewhat rushed and cut short. Yet, Sefer Shevet m'Yehuda² points out that when the Purim seuda takes place on erev Shabbos it has great significance as it serves as a great tikkun (rectification) for the sin of Adam ha'rishon who ate from the eitz ha'daas on erev Shabbos. The Gemara³ states that the name of Haman is hinted at in the Torah⁴ in the words "eitz ha'daas". Haman misled the Jewish people to eat from the seuda of Achashveirosh just as the snake misled Adam harishon to eat from the eitz ha'daas. Thus, the Purim Seuda rectifies the sin of eating at the seuda of Achashveirosh and the sin of Adam ha'rishon particularly when it occurs on erev Shabbos.

The mitzva of the Purim Seuda

One of the mitzvos of Purim is to eat a seuda (meal),⁵ as it states:⁶ "The Jewish people should celebrate the day of Purim; it should be a day of feasting."⁷ The Purim seuda commemorates that the miracle of Purim occurred through the seuda which Esther made for Achashveirosh and Haman.⁸

The correct time to fulfill the Purim seuda

One may eat the Purim seuda at any time during the day of Purim. The Mishna Berura writes that in a typical year the minhag has become to eat the Purim seuda in the late afternoon mitsup people are typically busy fulfilling the other mitsup of the day (i.e., mishloach manos, matanos lewonim). However, when Purim falls out on erev Shabbos, eating the Purim Seuda in the late afternoon is problematic because eating a seuda close to Shabbos detracts from the honor of Shabbos. To understand how the poskim deal with this issue, we will first quickly review the halachos of eating meals on erev Shabbos.

Eating Meals on Erev Shabbos

The Shulchan Aruch¹³ writes that *Chazal* instituted restrictions regarding eating large meals on *erev Shabbos*. The purpose of these restrictions is to ensure that one enjoys his Shabbos meal, as a person can only truly enjoy it if he is hungry and has a desire for food.¹⁴ The *Aruch haShulchan*¹⁵ writes that

"the primary way a person can honor Shabbos is by eating the Shabbos meal with a good appetite. One should be just about starving when he eats the Shabbos meal."

Eating a large meal on erev Shabbos

The Shulchan Aruch¹⁶ writes "It is prohibited to eat a meal on Friday which is larger than one normally eats during the week. One must refrain from eating such a meal the entire Friday so that he will be hungry when Shabbos arrives." For example, one may not invite friends over for a large barbeque or birthday party on a Friday, because eating a meal larger than he normally eats would take away from his enjoyment of the Shabbos meal.

Seudas mitzva

The Rema¹⁸ writes that *Chazal* did not prohibit eating a large meal which is a seudas mitzva that falls out on erev *Shabbos*. Accordingly, one may participate in the seuda of a bris mila, or pidyon haben which falls out on Friday.¹⁹

The Mishna Berura²⁰ writes that it is preferable to hold even a seudas mitzva in the early morning so that one can properly honor Shabbos by having an appetite for the Shabbos meal. The Mishna Berura²¹ explains that this means that one should begin the meal before chatzos [halachic midday; six hours (sha'aos zemanios) into the day].²² The poskim²³ indicate that one does not need to conclude the meal before chatzos, it is sufficient to at least begin one's meal before chatzos.²⁴ Although one will continue eating past chatzos and may ruin his appetite for the Shabbos meal, so long as one is careful to start the meal before chatzos he shows that he is honoring the Shabbos seuda.²⁵ However, b'dieved, one may eat a seudas mitzva the entire Friday, even close to Shabbos.²⁶

When Purim falls out on erev Shabbos

As we mentioned, when Purim falls out on erev Shabbos, one must be careful that the Purim seuda does not compromise one's Shabbos meal as eating a large Purim seuda can detract from the honor of the Shabbos meal. The poskim discuss two methods to fulfill the Purim seuda when Purim falls out on erev Shabbos:

- 1. The opinion of the Rema: Eating the seuda early in the day
- 2. The opinion of the Magen Avraham: Being Pores Mappah

Method #1: The opinion of the Rema - Early in the day

The Rema²⁷ writes that when Purim falls out on *erev Shabbos* one must eat the Purim *seuda* early in the day. Altough a *seudas mitzvah*, such as the Purim *seuda*, may be held on *erev Shabbos*, one should be careful to eat it early in the day to show the proper honor to the Shabbos meal. The Mishna Berura²⁸ writes that one should be careful to begin the Purim *seuda* before *chatzos*,

4 The Torah states (Bereishis 3:11) "Ha'min Ha'eitz (from the tree of the eitz 2 From Rav Avraham Eiger, vol. 2, Purim 5670 **5** Rema 695:1 **6** Esther 9:19 **7** Aruch ha'Shulchan 695:1 8 Pri Megadim, Mishpitzos Zahav, 695:1 9 The Shulchan Aruch (696:1) writes that the Purim seuda must be eaten by daytime, it may not be eaten by nighttime. 10 695:8 II In fact, some poskim rule that even on a typical year it is preferable to eat the Purim seuda in the morning and not in the afternoon. The Mishna Berura (695:9) cites the Shela hakadosh who writes that someone who eats his seuda in the morning is praiseworthy. The Rashash (cited in Kaf Hachaim 695:23) writes that "one should be careful to eat his Purim seuda early in the day, immediately after davening Shachris. This is something that I have accepted upon myself – to eat my Puim seuda immediately after Shachris. The Vilna Goan (Maseh Rav, 248) also writes that the main time for one to eat his Purim seuda is in the morning. The Vilna Goan would have his Purim seuda throughout the entire day to fulfil the verse "a day of drinking and happiness." 12 As once the time to daven Mincha arrives one may not begin the Purim seuda before davening Mincha (Mishna Berura 695:8) 13 249:2 14 Shulchan Aruch 249:2 15 249:6 **16** 249:2 **17** There is another reason given as to why one should not eat a large meal on erev Shabbos: The Magen Avraham (249:4) explains that we do not want someone to be so busy preparing the large meal on erev Shabbos that he will be distracted from preparing for the Shabbos meal. The Biur Halacha (249:2, d" h mipnei) cites that Pri Megadim who explains that the reason one may not have a large meal on erev Shabbos is because it is a Zilzul to Shabbos as tis equates his weekday meal on erev Shabbos to his Shabbos meal. 18 249:2. 19 The Biur Halacha (249, d"h oh pidyon) adds that one may eat a meal for a siyum maseches on erev Shabbos. However, this is true only if the masechta was completed on erev Shabbos. If it was completed before erev Shabbos the meal should not be scheduled for Friday (based on Shulchan Aruch and Rema, who write that only a mitzva whose time is specifically on Friday **20** 249:19 21 695:10 22 The Mishna Berura (ibid) also cites the opinion of the Yad Ephraim who holds that it is sufficient to start the seudas mitzvah 23 Shulchan Aruch HaRav (249:7); Elya Rabba (249:7); Aruch HaShulchan (249:6); they write that one must begin the meal before this time. before the tenth hour of the day. 24 Rav Shmuel Kaminetzky (Kovetz Halachos, Shabbos, I, p. 86, note 8) 25 Rav Shmuel Kaminetzky, ibid. Kovetz Halachos (ibid, note 8) explains that this reasoning may be understood best according to the reason of the Pri Megadim cited above in note 17, that having a large meal on erev Shabbos is a zilzul for Shabbos as it equates the Shabbos meal to the Friday meal. Therefore, so long as he begins the meal before chatzos he shows proper honor to the Shabbos meal by beginning the meal earlier in the day.

because, as we discussed above, even when eating a seudas mitzva one should begin the meal before chatzos.²⁹ By beginning the meal before chatzos one can finish his Purim seuda early enough to still have an appetite for the Shabbos meal. Sefer Yosef Ometz³⁰ (1723) writes "When Purim falls out on erev Shabbos, one should not eat his Purim seuda after chatzos as this takes away from the honor of the Shabbos meal which is a Torah obligation (and the Purim seuda is only a Rabbincal obligation). Therefore, it is appropriate to eat one's Purim seuda early in the day (before chatzos). Even so, he must be careful not to overeat or get overly drunk at his Purim seuda so that he will have an appetite and be able to enjoy his Shabbos meal."

The majority of poskim³¹ follow this opinion of the Rema to begin the Purim seuda in the morning before *chatzos*.

Method #2: The opinion of the Magen Avraham - Being Pores Mappah

There is another method discussed by the *poskim* that one may use to fulfill the mitzvah of eating the Shabbos meal and still have a Shabbos meal that will properly honor Shabbos. This method is known as *pores mappah* – spreading a cloth (over the food). This method combines the Purim *seuda* and the Shabbos meal into one long *seuda* by beginning the Purim *seuda* late Friday afternoon and continuing the meal into Shabbos. The Magen Avraham³² mentions the idea of being *pores mappah* when Purim falls out on *erev Shabbos*. The Meiri³³ writes that the custom of his family was to be *pores mappah*. However, not all *poskim* agree that being *pores mappah* is a preferred way to honor the Shabbos meal. In the following paragraphs we will discuss the halachos of being *pores mappah* and why some *poskim* are not in favor of using this method to conduct their Purim *seuda*.

The halachos of Pores Mappah

The Shulchan Aruch³⁴ discusses a scenario where (for whatever reason) someone was eating a meal right before Shabbos arrived. The Shulchan Aruch writes that once Shabbos arrives (i.e., at *shkiya* - sunset³⁵) "it is forbidden to eat or drink anything, even water (before he recites *Kiddush*). Even if he began the meal before Shabbos started, he must interrupt his meal to recite *Kiddush*. The Mishna Berura³⁶ explains that before he recites Kiddush, he must be *pores mappah* – use a cloth to cover the challah (and all the bread at the table³⁷). After *Kiddush* he removes the cloth and eats the challah for the Shabbos seuda and continues eating the Shabbos meal.

The purpose of covering the bread

The reason for covering the bread before reciting Kiddush is to show that he is restricted from eating the *challah* (or the rest of the meal) without first reciting Kiddush so that it is recognizable that any food that he continues to eat is now part of his Shabbos *seuda*.

The Issue with this Method: How will one have an appetite for his Shabbos meal?

The obvious issue with this method of *pores mappah* is that if one begins eating his Purim *seuda* late in the afternoon he will be satiated and no longer have an appetite for his Shabbos *seuda*. How then can this method justify eating the Purim *seuda* immediately before Shabbos begins?

Sefer Meoros Nasan³⁸ answers this question based on the Mishna Berura³⁹ who writes that "one's stomach only becomes satiated once he stops eating and finishes a meal as only then does his stomach close and become satiated. However, when a person is in the middle of a meal, his stomach remains open and one does not lose his appetite." Therefore, when one combines the Purim

seuda and the Shabbos seuda into one long meal he will still have an appetite to eat his Shabbos seuda.

Several poskim⁴⁰ write that this method of being pores mappah is the preferred way to conduct one's Purim seuda on erev Shabbos. The Zerah Emes writes "I was asked in the year 5558 (1778) when Purim fell out on erev Shabbos, what is the correct way to conduct one's Purim seuda. In my opinion, the most preferred way is to daven mincha early and then begin the Purim seuda late Friday afternoon close to Shabbos. One should then be pores mappah and continue the Shabbos seuda."

Not all poskim agree with the method of being pores mappah

However, other *poskim*⁴¹ argue that although the Shulchan Aruch mentions the method of being *pores mappah* it was only meant as a *b'dieved* if one has no other choice. However, *l'chatchilla* one should follow the method of the Rema and have his Purim seuda early in the morning so that he can eat the Shabbos meal with an appetite.⁴²

The sefer Orchos Chaim⁴³ concludes that "both of these methods are valid as they have a basis in the *poskim*. Thus, one should follow his custom (and either eat the Purim seuda early in the morning or begin the seuda late in the afternoon and be pores mappah).

Being Pores Mappah at one's Purim seuda

One who has the custom of following the method of being *pores mappah* at his Purim *seuda* should keep in mind the following halachos (which we will discuss in sequential order):

- One should daven Mincha early before beginning the Purim seuda.44
- One begins his Purim seuda close to the arrival of Shabbos. [He should complete all of his Shabbos preparations before the Seuda.]
- One must stop eating before Shabbos arrives (before shkiya). [He does not recite birchas hamazon as he will be continuing his meal after reciting Kiddush and will recite birchas hamazon after the Shabbos meal.]
- Women must light Shabbos candles at the normal time (18 minutes before shkiya). They may light at home or at the place where they will be eating the Shabbos meal. Once they light the candles they can no longer eat or drink until they hear Kiddush.
- One must take a break to daven Kabbalas Shabbos. Some⁴⁵ daven Maariv before the Shabbos meal; while others⁴⁶ daven Mariv after the Shabbos meal.
- Before reciting Kiddush, one must be pores mappah cover the challah (and other bread at the table).
- One must then recite Kiddush. [If one drank wine at the Purim seuda he does not recite a beracha of ha'gafen during Kiddush, rather he recites only the other parts of Kiddush.⁴⁷]
- One must then recite Hamotzie on Lechem Mishna.⁴⁸ [If one already recited Hamotzie at the Purim seuda he does not recite Hamotzie again,⁴⁹ rather he cuts up and distributes the Lechem Mishna to the other participants at the meal without reciting a beracha.]
- One must eat a k'zayis of the bread (preferable a k'beitza⁵⁰) at the Shabbos seuda.⁵¹ He should also eat food in honor of Shabbos just as he would at a regular Shabbos meal. He should even bring out a special dish in honor of Shabbos.⁵²
- At the conclusion of the Shabbos meal, one recites birchas hamazon and inserts the prayer of retzei.⁵³ The Mishna Berura⁵⁴ rules that one should not insert Al Hanissim during birchas hamzaon, because this would be a tarti d'sasrei (a contradiction); since he recites retzei (which is inserted for Shabbos) during birchas hamazon, he cannot recite Al Hanissim (which is inserted for Purim which was on Friday).
- Those who did not yet recite Maariv do so after the Shabbos seuda.55

The intention of this summary is to discuss common practical shavlos. One should consult a Ray concerning p'sak halacha.

²⁶ Levush cited in Magen Avraham (249:6). He explains that since eating a seduas mitzvah is also a mitzvah, why then should we push away one mitzvah (of the seudas Purim) for anther mitzvah (the Shabbos meal). See Biur Halacha 249:2, d"h mutar. 27 695:2 28 695:10 29 As we mentioned above, the Mishna Berura (695:10) cites the opinion of the Yad Ephraim who holds that it is sufficient to start the seudas mitzvah before the tenth hour of the day. 30 Siman 1104 31 Siddur Yavetz (Purim Seuda); Kitzur Shulchan Aruch 142:5; Mishna Berura 249:13; Aruch Hashulchan, OC 249:7; Shemiras Shabbas k'hilchasa 42:27; Yechave Da'as 3:55, Halichos Shlomo 19:26; Leket Yosher p. 156; Mikadesh Yisroel, Purim 309-311; Rabbi Doniel Neustadt (The Daily Halacha Discussion p. 152). See also Chazon Ovadia p. 179 for a list of poskim who rule that one should eat the Purim seuda on Friday morning. **32** 695:9 **33** Kesubos 7a **34** 271:4, in the halachos of Shabbos **35** Mishna Berura 271:11 **36** 271:15 **38** Purim 49:4 **39** 291:3 40 Meiri (Kesubos 7a); Nahar Mitzrayim (13); Krias Chana Dovid (90) 41 Leket Yosher p. 156; Shoel of Maharil (56:8); Mikadesh Yisroel, Purim 309 42 See Mikadesh Yisroel, Purim 309 43 Siman 37 (cited in Purim Meshulash 1: note 9) 44 Zera Emes (3:79) 45 Zerah Emes 3:79. This will conform with the writing of the Arizal (cited in Kaf HaChaim 271:22) that based on kabbalah on must keep to the order of davening Maariv and then eating the Shabbos 46 Purim Meshulash 1:6 47 Shulchan Aruch 271:4 48 Purim Meshulash 1:6 49 Shulchan Aruch 271:4 cites two opinions regarding whether one must recite another beracha of Hamotzie. The Mishna Berura (271:18) rules that since there is a doubt one should not recite the beracha. 50 See Mishna Berura 291:2 51 See Mishna Berura 291:2; Purim Meshulash 1:6 52 Purim Meshulash 1:6 53 Mishna Berura 271:30 54 695:15. However, other poskim rule that Al Hanissim should be recited (Pri Megadim 695, mishpitzos zahav 3; see Chazon Ovadia p.183) 55 Purim Meshulash 1:6. When one is not davening at shul, one does not recite the Birchas Me'ein sheva at the end of davening (Purim Meshulash 1: note 21).