Practical Modern-Day Controversies

In Hilchos You have heard the shaylos . . . Now learn the issues & the opinions

The halachos and minhagim of

YaKNeHa"Z

When Motzei Shabbos falls out on Yov Tov

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

When Yom Tov falls out on Motzai Shabbos, as it does this Yom Tov, there are a number of unique halachos and customs which are relevant. In the following paragraphs we will discuss the following halachos:

- I) Performing melacha after Shabbos ends
- 2) The Havdalah of YaKNeHa"Z
- 3) One who forgot to recite Havdalah

I) Performing melacha after Shabbos ends

Although the Torah¹ states that "One may not perform melachos [on Yom Tov]," it is nevertheless permitted to perform any melacha which is necessary for Ochel Nefesh such as cooking or lighting the Yom Tov candles at the dining room table.²

When Yom Tov falls out on Motzai Shabbos one may only begin performing these melachos after the conclusion of Shabbos after tzais ha'kochavim (the emergence of three stars) and Shabbos has entirely ended.

- For example, someone who normally waits 50 minutes after Shkiya before performing melacha on Motzei Shabbos, must wait 50 minutes before beginning to cook or light the Yom Tov candles.
- Someone who normally waits 72 minutes after Shkiya before performing melacha on Motzei Shabbos, must wait 72 minutes before beginning to cook or light the Yom Toy candles.

Additionally, the Shulchan Aruch³ writes that before one actually performs *melacha* on *Motzei Shabbos* he must recite *Havdalah*, or at the very least recite: "baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'chol" (Blessed... who separates between the holy [day of Shabbos] and the mundane [days of the weekdays]). For example, a woman who is waiting for her husband to come home from *shul* may perform *melacha* (after *tzais ha'kochavim*) by merely reciting "baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'chol".

The Mishna Berura⁴ explains that by reciting this declaration "one recognizes the holiness of Shabbos, and escorts the King", and therefore permits performing melacha. [Note: Although simply reciting this declaration permits performing melacha one may not eat or drink before actually reciting Havdalah.⁵]

The Mishna Berura⁶ adds, that when Motzei Shabbos coincides with Yom Tov one recites a slightly different version of this declaration: "baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'kodesh" (Blessed are you [Hashem] who separates between the holy [day of Shabbos] and the holy [day of Yom Tov]).

For example, a woman that wishes to begin performing *melacha* on *Yom Tov* that is necessary for *ochel nefesh* and is waiting for her husband to come home from *shul* and recite *Havdalah* (on *Motzei Shabbos*), may perform these *melachos* (after *tzais ha'kochavim*) by merely reciting "baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh **l'kodesh**".

2) The Havdalah of YaKNeHa"Z

When Motzai Shabbos is also Yom Tov we are met with two obligations:

- a) recitation of **Havdalah** for the Shabbos that passed
- b) recitation of Kiddush for the Yom Tov that has arrived

The Shulchan Aruch⁷ writes that we therefore recite both *Kiddush* and *Havdalah* in one combined recitation known as *YaKNeHa*"Z. During the recitation of *YaKNeHa*"Z we recite the following five *berachos* whose acronym is *YaKNeHa*"Z:

- I- Yayin: the beracha on the wine
- 2- Kiddush: the beracha proclaiming the holiness of the day
- 3- Ner: the beracha on the fire of Havdalah
- 4- Havdalah- the recitation of Havdalah
- 5- Zman: the beracha of Shechiyanu- thanking Hakadosh baruch Hu for allowing us to reach this time. [Note: A woman who recited the beracha of Shechiyanu while lighting the Yom Tov candles does not repeat it during Kiddush (if her custom is to recite her own Kiddush at the Pesach Seder).8]

We will discuss several differences between the Havdalah of YaKNeHa"Z and that of a regular Havdalah:

I. Overflowing the cup of wine

The Rama⁹ writes the custom is that when one pours the wine of Havdalah to overflow the cup. He explains that this is based on the Gemara¹⁰ which states that 'any home that does not have wine that pours like water will not have in it beracha,' and thus we do this to begin the week with a good sign. Rav Shlomo Zalman Aurbach¹¹ writes that when Motzei Shabbos coincides with Yom Toy the custom is not to overflow the cup of

Havdalah, because since it is prohibited to involve oneself in business on Yom Tov, we do not overflow the cup of wine as it symbolizes a request for abundance of prosperity as this would be a disgrace to the holiness of Yom Tov. ¹²

2. Should one stand or sit during YaKNeHa"Z?

Some have the custom to sit during Kiddush on Shabbos and Yom Tov throughout the year and some have the custom to stand during Kiddush throughout the year, and this applies to Kiddush recited on the night of the Seder as well.¹³ The Mishna Berura¹⁴ writes that [someone who has the custom to sit during Kiddush] should sit while reciting the Havdalah of YaKNeHa"Z as well even if he normally stands for Havdalah. Since he is sitting for the recitation of Kiddush, he should sit for Havdala as well since it is one recitation.¹⁵

3. Besamim is not used

The Mishna Berura¹⁶ explains that generally, we smell the spices of besamim during the Havdalah "in an attempt to console one's soul which is pained by the leaving of Shabbos as one's neshama yiseira (extra soul) which one receives on Shabbos departs at the conclusion of Shabbos." However, the Mishna Berura¹⁷ writes that when Motzei Shabbos coincides with Yom Tov we do not use besamim. He explains that although one's neshama yiseira departs after Shabbos ends and one does not receive a neshama yiseira on Yom Tov, one's soul is consoled by the good food which is served on Yom Tov just as besamim does and thus there is no need to smell besamim.

4. Women drinking from the Havdalah wine

The Mishna Berura¹⁸ writes that the custom is that women generally do not drink from the Havdalah wine. This custom is based on the writings of the Sh'lah Ha'Kadosh¹⁹ who states that women should not drink from the wine of Havdalah to rectify the sin of Chava who gave Adam Ha'Rishon to eat from the eitz ha'da'as (the tree of knowledge). According to one opinion in the Gemara the eitz ha'da'as was a grape vine and Chava squeezed the grapes of the eitz ha'da'as and gave its wine to Adam to drink. Since Chava intended to separate herself from Adam with this wine, women do not drink the wine of Havdalah (separation).

When the Pesach Seder falls out on *Motzei Shabbos*, Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach²⁰ writes that those who has the custom for everyone, both men and women, to recite their own *Kiddush*, may do so even when on *Motzei Shabbos*. Women may recite Havdalah on their own and drink from the wine of *YaKNeHa*"Z. Since the wine is also used for Kiddush (and is the primary function of *YaKNeHa*"Z) a woman may drink from the wine even though it is used for *Havdalah* as well.

5. The Havdalah candle

The Gemara²¹ teaches that on Motzei Shabbos we recite a beracha on fire because Adam Ha'Rishon made the first fire on Motzai Shabbos by grinding two stones together and created a flame. Therefore, we recite the beracha of "borei me'orei ha'aish" ("...Who creates the illumination of fire") to express gratitude to Hashem for giving Adam the wisdom to understand how to create fire.

The Shulchan Aruch²² writes that the preferable way to perform this mitzvah is to use a torch, because it gives off a lot of light and therefore enhances the mitzvah for the Havdalah candle.²³ The Rama²⁴ explains that a candle which consists of two wicks is classified as a torch. The Mishna Berura²⁵ adds that even putting two candles together so that their wicks touch (and the flames join together) is considered a torch. The Mishnah Berura²⁶ concludes however that while it is certainly preferable to use a torch to perform this mitzvah, if one does not have a torch he can fulfill this mitzvah with even just one candle.

Using a Torch for YaKNeHa"Z

When Motzei Shabbos coincides with Yom Tov using a torch for Havdalah is problematic and is subject to much controversy amongst the poskim. For one to use a regular Havdalah candle would not be practical since one would not be able to extinguish it after it is used (as doing so violates the prohibition of Mechabeh). To avoid this issue, a 'YaKNeHa''Z candle' was recently manufactured to help create a torch on Yom Tov. We will discuss several possible ways to create a torch on Yom Tov and whether it is recommended to use a 'YaKNeHa''Z candle' to create a torch.

a. Connecting two candles together

The poskim debate whether it is permissible to take two candles which were already lit for candle lighting and bring them together so that their flames connect and create a torch. Although some poskim²⁷ permit using this method to create a torch on Yom Tov, many poskim²⁸ question this method based on the following ruling of the Shulchan Aruch:

1 Shemos 21:16 2 Ibid. Regarding whether lighting Yom Tov candles is permitted because of "Ochel Nefesh" or because of "Mitoch" see Rabbi Akiva Eiger 501 on Taz, 7; Shitta Mekubetzes Beitza 21b; Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso 13, note 87 3 299:10 4 Mishna Berura 299:34 5 Mishna Berura 299:35 6 Mishna Berura 299:36 7 Shulchan Aruch 473:1 8 Kovetz Halachos, Pesach p. 317 9 296:1 10 Eiruvin 65a 11 Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso 62,15 note 26 12 However, Rav Yitzchak Zilberstein (cited in Sukkas Chaim, kuntres Erev Pesach she'chal b'Shabbos, p. 82) writes that a Ben Torah whose 'success' is determined by his success in learning Torah may overflow the cup and have in mind that he should be successful in his learning. 13 Kaf ha'Chaim 473:8; Yesod v'Shoresh ha'Avoda 9:6; Kovetz Halachos Pesach p. 313, note 6. However, Rav Moshe Feinstein (5:16:8) writes that someone who normally stands during Kiddush should sit during the Kiddush at the Seder, because Kiddush on the night of the Seder is the first of the Arbah Kosos and should be done derech cheirus, in a way of freedom, which is reclining. 14 473:3 15 Mishna Berura; bid. See Kovetz Halachos, libid. 16 297:2; 491:3 17 473:3; 491:3 18 Mishna Berura 296:6 19 Shneit Luchos Ha'bris, Mesechta Shabbos, Torah Ohr, 99 20 Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso 62:16 (based on Ketzos ha'Shulchan, badei 97:3); Halichos Shlomo 9:23; Rav Shmuel Wosner (m'Bais Levi 18, p. 21) 21 Pesachim 54; see Mishnah Berura 298:1 22 298:2 23 Mishna Berura 298:5 24 298:7 27 Yesod v'Shoresh ha'Avodah 9:end of 85); Shevet HaLevi (11:128); Orchos Rabbeinu (2, p. 11, 40) see sefer Yom Tov Sheini k'hilchaso 1, note 68 citing Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv. 28 Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (SSk'h 62:18); Ohr l'Tzion (3:18, note 6); Rav Nissim Karelitz Chut Shani,

The Shulchan Aruch²⁹ rules that if a pile of firewood is burning in a furnace on Yom Tov, one may not remove one of the logs (which has already caught on fire). Since the firewood have become "one flame," removing a log gives off the appearance of Mechabeh (Extinguishing) since the intensity of the fire is diminished to some degree.

Similarly, these poskim argue that connecting two candles together is not a viable option to create a torch because when one separates the candles from each other it diminishes the intensity of the torch.³⁰

However, the *poskim* who permit separating the two candles argue that separating the two candles cannot be compared to the ruling of the *Shulchan Aruch*. The two candles are only connected *temporarily* with intention to separate them and thus never became "one flame" and thus separating them does not give the appearance of *Mechabeh*.³¹

b. Lighting two matches

Another possible method which is suggested by the *poskim*³² is light two matches together to create a torch (or to place a match together with a tealight). When the two matches are put together it forms two wicks and is considered a "torch" which can then be left together to extinguish on its own without separating the two matches.

However, other $poskim^{33}$ do not recommend this method based on the halacha of ner shel batalah - a candle that is ignited for a need which is not genuinely needed for Yom Tov:

The Shulchan Aruch³⁴ rules that one may only ignite a fire on Yom Tov if there is real purpose or Yom Tov need. For example, the Mishna Berura³⁵ writes that according to many poskim it is questionable whether one may light a Yizkor candle on Yom Tov, because it does not produce a true benefit for Yom Tov and may be considered a ner shel batalah. Therefore, the Mishna Berura concludes that one should be careful to light a Yizkor candle before Yom Tov begins, or at least light it in a dark room where one can benefit from its light. However, if in a time of need one may light the Yizkor candle on Yom Tov since honoring one's parents with a Yizkor candle may be considered a Yom Tov need.

Similarly, these *poskim* do not recommend lighting two matches or candles specifically to fulfill the mitzvah of *Havdalah* since the fire is not lit to bring enjoyment for *Yom Tov*, but rather to fulfill the *mitzvah* of *Havdalah*. Although it is preferable to use a torch to fulfill the mitzvah of Havdalah, since it is not truly necessary to fulfill the mitzvah, it may be considered lighting a *ner shel batalah* and is prohibited.³⁶

However, other *poskim*³⁷ consider lighting a fire to produce a torch to be a genuine Yom Tov need because unlike a *Yizkor* candle whose purpose is not to produce light but to honor one's parents, the *Havdalah* candle is lit to produce and benefit from the light so that one can perform the mitzvah of Havdalah. Therefore, these *poskim* rule that lighting two matches (or placing a match together with a tealight) is a permissible way to perform Havdalah on *Yom Tov*.

c. Using a 'YaKNeHa"Z candle'

Recently, a 'YaKNeHa'Z candle' was manufactured which looks like a regular candle just that it contains two wicks. This candle can be used as one of the Yom Tov candles which are lit at the onset of Yom Tov and then later used for Havdalah. One should not light this candle specifically for Havdalah for as we mentioned, some poskim do not permit lighting a candle specifically for Havdalah as it is considered *ner shel batalah*.

d. Bringing two candles near each other

Many poskim³⁸ suggest that one simply take two candles and place them near each other (without connecting them together) to produce additional light and fulfill the hiddur of using "a torch" to some degree. Additionally, as we mentioned, one can fulfill the mitzvah of Havdalah without a torch, as it is sufficient to use just one candle. Therefore, many poskim did not connect the two candles but merely brought them closer together to perform the mitzvah of Havdalah.

In conclusion, Rav Moshe Feinstein³⁹ writes that both of these options (either connecting two candles or merely bringing them closer together) are strong customs, as certainly those who connect two candles together on Yom Tov have seen this by their parents and thus both are *halachically* acceptable options. One should follow his family's custom regarding whether or not to use a torch on *Motzei Shabbos* which coincides with *Yom Tov.*⁴⁰

6. Looking at one's fingernails during Havdala

The Shulchan Aruch⁴¹ writes that when reciting the beracha of borei me'orei ha'eish over the Havdala candle the custom is to look at one's fingernails. The Mishna Berura⁴² explains that this custom is based on the halacha that states that one must derive enough benefit from the light of the Havdala candle that he can differentiate between two different objects. We look at our fingernails to determine whether there is enough light to differentiate between our fingernails and the skin that surrounds them.

The poskim give two reasons why specifically use one's fingernails as the indicator and not a different object:

- The Mishna Berura⁴³ explains that we look at our fingernails in the beginning of the week as a good sign for beracha, because fingernails are always growing.
- 2) The Pri Megadim⁴⁴ explains that Chazal teach us that before Adam haRishon sinned his entire body was covered with the material of fingernails. When he sinned, this material contracted to cover only the ends of his fingers, and the rest of his body was covered by skin. In order to remember the sin of Adam we look at our fingernails during Havdala.

The $poskim^{45}$ write that when reciting Havdalah during $YaKNeHa^{\circ\prime}Z$ the custom is not to look at one's fingernails. This may be based on the two reasons given above:

- Looking at one's fingernails is a sign for beracha. Just as we do not overflow the cup of wine during YaKNeHa"Z since it is prohibited to involve oneself in business on Yom Tov, so too we do not look at our fingernails for a sign of beracha.⁴⁶
- Remembering the sin of Adam haRishon. Some⁴⁷ explain that on Yom Tov we also do not want to remember the sin of Adam haRishon as this is something associated with pain and is not appropriate to be done on Yom Tov.⁴⁸

Nevertheless, when reciting the beracha of borei me'orei ha'eish one should gaze at the fire of Havdala so that he benefits from the fire.⁴⁹

7. Concluding Havdala with "Hamavdil bein Kodesh l'kodesh"

The Tur⁵⁰ writes that the recitation of Havdala concludes with the beracha of "Hamavdil bein Kodesh <u>l'kodesh.</u>"

If one mistakenly concluded "Hamavdil bein Kodesh <u>P'chol</u>." Many poskim⁵¹ rule that if one incorrectly concluded Havdala by reciting Hamavdil bein Kodesh <u>P'chol</u> the Havdala is invalid since he altered the wording which Chazal established to be said. Delete However, Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv⁵³ was uncertain about this question and ruled that since there is a doubt as to whether one should repeat Havdala one should not repeat it since safek berachos l'hakel.

3) One who Forgot to Recite Havdalah during YaKNeHa"Z

The Shulchan Aruch and later poskim discuss what to do if one forgot to recite Havdalah during YaKNeHa"Z. On other Yomim Tovim (other than Pesach) this would not be such an issue for as soon as one remembers that he did not recite Havdalah he could pour another cup of wine and recite Havdalah over it. However, on the night of the Seder there is a halacha of "not giving off the appearance of adding to the Arba Kosos by drinking another cup of wine." Thus, depending on which point of the Seder one remembers that he did not recite Havdalah it may be questionable whether he may pour another cup of wine and recite Havdalah over it, as we will discuss:

- 1- If one remembered while he was still in middle of drinking (the first cup of) the Kiddush wine, he may refill the cup and recite Havdalah (without having to recite boreh pri ha'gafen).⁵⁴ Since he is still in middle of the first cup, refilling it does not appear to be adding to the Arbah Kosos.⁵⁵
- 2- If one remembered after Kiddush but before eating the karpas, the Biur Halacha⁵⁶ writes that it is questionable whether he should recite Havdala at this point. On the one hand, reciting Havdalah over a cup of wine may appear to be adding to the Arbah Kosos, yet on the other hand it is prohibited to eat before reciting Havdalah and it would thus be questionable whether one may eat the karpas before reciting Havdalah.
- 3- If one remembered after he ate karpas but while he is in middle of reciting the Haggadah, the Shulchan Aruch⁵⁷ writes that he should wait to recite Havdalah until he finishes reciting the Haggadah. When he concludes Maggid and reaches the second cup and recites borei pri hagafen he should also recite the beracha on the fire and the beracha of Havdalah.⁵⁸
- 4- If one remembered after he drank the second cup and is in middle of his seuda, the Mishna Berura⁵⁹ writes that he must stop eating as it is prohibited to eat before reciting Havdalah and pour a cup of wine and recite Havdalah over it (without reciting borei pri ha'gafen⁶⁰).
- 5- If one remembered after he began reciting Birchas Hamazon, the Mishna Berura⁶¹ writes that he should recite Havdalah on the third cup (which is recited after Birchas HaMazon). Similarly, if he only remembered before the fourth cup he should recite Havdalah over the fourth cup of wine.⁶²
- **6-** If one remembered after he already drank the fourth cup, the Mishna Berura⁶³ writes that he should pour an additional cup and recite Havdalah over it (and recite borei pri ha'gafen). Although this gives the appearance of adding a cup to the Arbah Kosos it must nevertheless be done since there is no other way to perform Havdalah.⁶⁴

The intention of this summary is to discuss common practical shaylos. One should consult a Rav concerning p'sak halacha.

Yom Tov Sheini K'hilchaso, ibid note 67 citing sefer Erev Shabbos s'chal b'Shabbos; Kovetz Halachos p. 321, note 17. 29 502-2; Mishna Berura 502:20 30 In truth, the case of the Shulchan Aruch deals with only a pile of wood which are wrapped together and are considered one fire and alto gave and holds that Rema argues and holds that even if the pile of wood is not wrapped together it is considered one fire, and a log may not be removed. However, Mishna Berura (503:19) writes that the Rema argues and holds that even if the pile of wood is not wrapped together is considered one fire, and a log may not be removed. However, Mishna Berura (503:19) writes that the Rema argues and holds that even if the pile of wood is not wrapped together is considered one fire, and a log may not be removed. However, Mishna Berura writes that even in such a case it is appropriate to be stringent and not to remove the log. The issue with separating the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Remai it is also technically permitted to separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Remai it is also technically permitted to separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Remai it is also technically permitted to separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Remai it is also technically permitted to separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Remai it is also technically permitted to separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Mishna Berura it is nevertheless appropriate to be stringent. This case and not separate the two candles solviously does not apply according to the Mishna Berura it is nevertheless appropriate to be stringent. This case and not according to the Mishna Berura it is nevertheless appropriate to be stringent. This case and not according to the Mishna Berura it is never the advanced to the major and the service of the major and the service and the service of the major and the service and the service