

In Hilchos Shabbos

You have heard the shaylos . . .
Now learn the issues & the opinions

The *halachos* and *minhagim* of
**When
Erev Tisha b'Av
falls out
on Shabbos**

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by **Rabbi Shmuel Stein** at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

The Day of Tisha b'Av

There were several tragic occurrences that happened on the day of *Tisha b'Av*. The Gemara¹ explains that the first of these occurrences was the sin of the *Mi'raglim* (spies), which took place when the Jewish people were traveling through the *Midbar*. They sent spies to scout the land of *Eretz Yisroel*, and when the spies returned from their mission, they delivered a derogatory report about the land. Upon hearing the derogatory description of *Eretz Yisroel* the Jewish people began to weep. The Gemara states that this sinful incident occurred on the eve of *Tisha b'Av*. In response to sinful reaction of the Jewish people *HaKadosh Baruch Hu* said: "Because you wept in vain, I will establish this day of *Tisha b'Av* as a time of true weeping for all generations." Indeed, both the first and second *Batei HaMikdash* were destroyed on *Tisha b'Av*,² as well as many other tragedies that befell the Jewish people.³ *Tishah b'Av* is a time of mourning and introspection over the loss of the *Beis HaMikdash* and the tragedies that befell the Jewish people as a result of this loss.⁴

However, on Shabbos it is prohibited to show signs of mourning over the *Bais Hamikdash*, as this would detract from the honor and holiness of Shabbos. Therefore, when *erev Tisha b'Av* falls out on Shabbos some of the typical *halachos* do not apply, as we will discuss.

The Halachos of when erev Tisha b'Av falls out on Shabbos

This year when *erev Tisha b'Av* falls out on Shabbos and it is prohibited to show signs of mourning, some of the *halachos* and *minhagim* of *Tisha b'Av* are adjusted and other *halachos* are added. We will review these *halachos* and how they contrast to the *halachos* which apply to a typical year.

Erev Tisha b'Av

There are several *halachos* which apply on a typical year on *erev Tisha b'Av* but are different on this year.

1. Torah Learning on erev Tisha b'Av

The Rema⁵ writes that on a typical year, the custom is to refrain from learning Torah on *erev Tisha b'Av* from after *Chatzos*. "Torah learning gladdens a person's heart,"⁶ and if one were to learn Torah on *erev Tisha b'Av* from *Chatzos* and on, his joy from learning Torah would continue into *Tisha b'Av* itself.⁷ Therefore, on a typical year, on *erev Tisha b'Av*, one may learn only the topics that may be studied on *Tisha b'Av*, such as portions of Gemara that deal with the destruction of the *Bais Hamikdash*.

When erev Tisha b'Av falls out on Shabbos. The Rema⁸ rules that this custom applies to Shabbos that is *erev Tisha b'Av* as well. He writes that "on this Shabbos *Pirkei Avos* is not learned in shul after *Mincha*." According to the Rema, on this Shabbos after *Chatzos*, one may learn only topics that may be learned on *Tisha b'Av*.⁹ However, the *Mishna Berura*¹⁰ cites others who argue on the Rema and rule that when *erev Tisha b'Av* falls out on Shabbos one may learn Torah even past *Chatzos*. The *Taz* states that "someone who learns Torah on Shabbos after *Chatzos* does not lose his reward." The *Mishna Berura*¹¹ concludes, "That one may rely on these lenient opinions." This is especially true if refraining from learning Torah will lead to spending one's time idly on Shabbos.¹²

2. Taking a leisurely walk on erev Tisha b'Av

The Rema¹³ writes that one should not take a leisurely walk on *erev Tisha b'Av*, as it brings happiness to a person. Just as we refrain from learning Torah on

erev Tisha b'Av we do not take leisurely walks on *erev Tisha b'Av* as well.¹⁴ This *halacha* applies even when *erev Tisha b'Av* falls out on Shabbos. Although some opinions permit learning Torah on Shabbos, this is only because learning Torah is a *mitzvah* but does not apply to taking a walk on Shabbos.¹⁵ Accordingly, one should refrain from taking a leisurely walk on Shabbos after *Chatzos*.

Preparing on Shabbos for after Shabbos

Preparing on Shabbos for a post-Shabbos need violates the prohibition of *Hachana*. Therefore, one may not prepare on Shabbos for *Tisha b'Av*. For example:

- One may not bring his *Tisha b'Av* shoes to Shul on Shabbos.¹⁶
- One may not bring a *kinnos* or *Tisha b'Av* chair to Shul on Shabbos.¹⁷

Therefore, one must ensure that these items are brought to Shul either before Shabbos begins or after Shabbos ends, as we will later discuss in more detail.

The Seuda ha'Mafsek

On a typical year we eat a meal immediately before *Tisha b'Av* called the *Seuda ha'Mafsek* (the last meal before the fast). The purpose of this meal is to evoke feelings of sorrow and mourning. The *Vilna Gaon*¹⁸ writes that "the mood during the *seuda ha'mafsek* should resemble someone who has just lost a close relative, and the dead body is lying in front of him." It is said of the holy Chasam Sofer¹⁹ that already on the afternoon before *Tisha b'Av*, he would begin crying bitterly over the loss of the *Bais Hamikdash*. He would then collect these tears in a cup, and during the *seudah ha'mafsek* he would dip his bread into the tears as a sign of mourning. On a typical year, it is customary to serve a plain piece of bread (dipped into ashes) and a hard-boiled egg at this meal. When eating this meal, on a typical year, one sits on the floor, and a *zimun* with other people is not performed. However, when *erev Tisha b'Av* falls out on Shabbos, the mournful atmosphere that generally accompanies the *Seuda Ha'mafsek* is not adhered to. Instead, one's regular *Shalosh Seudos* becomes the *Seuda Ha'mafskes*.

The following *halachos* apply to the *Seduah ha'Mafsek* this year on Shabbos:

Eating and drinking at Shalosh Seudos. One may eat and drink as one normally does during *Shalosh Seudos*. The *Shulchan Aruch*²⁰ writes that at this meal, "one may eat meat and drink wine, and may even prepare a meal like that of Shlomo Ha'melech". It is even permissible to even eat more than one regularly does, in order to prepare for the upcoming fast.²¹ The *Mishnah Berura*²² adds that not only is it permissible to eat lavishly at this meal, but "it is actually forbidden to eat less than one regularly does at this meal if his intention is for the sake of mourning." However, one eats in preparation for the fast, he should not verbally express that his intention is to prepare for after Shabbos, since doing so would violate the prohibition of *Hachana*.²³

The mood. Although a lavish meal may be served for this *Seuda Ha'mafskes*, the *Mishnah Berura*²⁴ writes that one should sit in a somber mood during the meal.

Zimiro. One may sing regular Shabbos *zemiros* at this meal.²⁵ However, one should refrain from singing joyous *zemiros*, for as the *Mishna Berura* writes there should be a somber mood during the meal.^{25a}

Zimun. One may eat *Shalosh Seudos* together with his family, and a *Zimun* may be performed at this meal.²⁶

Guests. The *Mishnah Berura*²⁷ writes that one should not invite guests to this *Seuda Ha'mafsek*. However, he adds that if someone normally has guests

1 Ta'anis 29a 2 Mishnah Berura 549:2 3 The Mishnah Berura (ibid) lists a number of other things which occurred on *Tisha b'Av*: It was decreed on *Tisha b'Av* that the Jews in the *Midbar* not enter Eretz Yisroel, the city of *Beitar* was destroyed on *Tisha b'Av* and myriads of Jews were killed and the suffering was as great as the destruction of the *Beis HaMikdash*, the roman general Turnus Rufus plowed the site of the *Beis HaMikdash*. 4 The Brisker Rav, quoted in Artscroll Kinnos (kinnah 25) 5 Rema end of siman 553 *Mishna Berura* 553:9 6 *Mishna Berura* 554:8 7 Chasam Sofer Teshuvos (O.C. 156) 8 Ibid 9 Even according to the Rema it is permissible to learn *Shnayim Mikrah* after *Chatzos* (Kovetz Halachos pg. 64, Mikadeish Yisroel, Bein Hamitzarim p. 101) 10 553:10 11 ibid 12 Kovetz Halachos pg. 280-281 13 Rema end of siman 553 See Kovetz Halachos pg. 281 14 As explained in Kovetz Halachos pg. 208 note 2, and pg. 282 note 12 15 Kovetz Halachos ibid 16 Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso 28:85 17 ibid 18 Shulchan Aruch 552:7 d'h v'ain 19 Artscroll Kinnos in the overview pg. XI 20 Shulchan Aruch 552:10 21 Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso 28:85 22 Mishnah Berura 552:23 23 Ibid 24 552:23 25 Kovetz Mi'Bais Levi pg. 43 number 12 25a Mikadeish Yisroel, minhagei erev Tisha b'Av, 28 26 Mishnah Berura 552:23

over for *Shalosh Seudos* he may invite guests to this meal as well. Some *poskim*²⁸ write that a communal *Shalosh Seudos* should not be served at Shul on this Shabbos. Others²⁹ however do allow a communal *Shalosh Seudos*. If one does attend a communal *Shalosh Seudos* he should be careful that the mood is appropriate for the *Seuda Ha'masfkes*.

Taking medication in preparation of the fast

Some people find it helpful to take Advil or other medication before the fast begins. However, taking these medications on Shabbos may be problematic for a couple of reasons:

- 1) *Refuah*: Taking medication on Shabbos is generally prohibited under the rabbinical prohibition of *Refuah* (Healing).
- 2) *Hachana*: Taking medication on Shabbos in preparation for the fast may violate the prohibition of *Hachana*.

Accordingly, some *poskim*³⁰ prohibit taking medication on Shabbos in order to prepare for the fast. However, other *poskim*³¹ permit taking these medications on Shabbos. A Rav should be consulted regarding this issue.

The Fast Begins

The fast begins at *Shkiya* (sunset).³² One must ensure that he finishes eating before this time. The *Mishna Berura*³³ warns that since during the rest of the year *Shalosh Seudos* usually continues past *Shkiya*, it is appropriate to remind others that during *Shalosh Seudos* this week one must finish eating before *Shkiya* arrives. One may recite *Birchas Hamazon* after *Shkiya*.³⁴

The other Tisha b'Av prohibitions also begin at Shkiya. Just as the prohibition against eating and drinking begins at *Shkiya*, most of the other prohibitions of *Tisha b'Av*, such as washing one's hands and anointing oneself, begin at *Shkiya* as well.³⁵ However, some of the *Tisha b'Av* prohibitions do not begin immediately at *Shkiya*, as we will now discuss.

Transition from Shabbos into Tisha b'Av: Changing into Weekday Clothing

Until this point, we have discussed the halachos that apply to Shabbos, we will now discuss the halachos that apply to transitioning from Shabbos into *Tisha b'Av* (*Motzei Shabbos*).

Bein Ha'shmashos (Twilight period)

The period of *Bein Hashmashos* (from *Shkiya* until *Tzais Ha'kochavim* [nightfall]) is a time of uncertainty, as it is unclear whether it is daytime or nighttime. Therefore, *Bein Hashmashos* takes on the stringencies of both Shabbos (daytime) and *Tisha b'Av* (nighttime). This presents somewhat of a conflict regarding when to change out of one's Shabbos clothing and into one's weekday clothing and *Tisha b'Av* shoes. The *poskim*³⁶ rule that one may not change into his *Tisha b'Av* shoes until *Tzais Ha'kochavim* (nightfall) arrives. Since wearing *Tisha b'Av* shoes is a public act of mourning on Shabbos, it is prohibited to wear them until *Tzais Ha'kochavim* arrives. Similarly, one may not sit on a low chair until *Tzais Ha'kochavim* arrives.

The two customs regarding how to transition into Tisha b'Av

There are two customs regarding when one should daven Maariv and change into weekday clothing:

Custom #1- Daven Maariv at the regular time

Many³⁷ begin Maariv on *Motzei Shabbos* at the same time they would normally begin on a regular *Motzei Shabbos*. One wears his Shabbos shoes and sits on a regular chair until davening begins. Once *Barechu* is recited, one removes his shoes and sits on a low chair. Those who follow this custom must ensure that they bring their *Tisha b'Av* shoes and *kinnos* to shul before Shabbos. [One need not be concerned about the fact that he is still wearing his Shabbos clothing (other than his Shabbos shoes) after reciting *Barchu*, because this is not considered an obvious contradiction to mourning on *Tisha b'Av*.³⁸] We

will soon discuss how Havdalah is performed this Shabbos, but one who follows this custom must recite the *beracha* on the Havdalah candle in Shul, and woman may recite this *beracha* on their own in their homes.³⁹

Custom #2- Postponing Maariv

Others⁴⁰ have a custom to postpone Maariv so that people have a chance to change into their weekday clothing and *Tisha b'Av* shoes in their homes and then drive to Shul for Maariv. One must recite "*Baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'chol*" before performing any *melacha*. Once "*Baruch Ha'mavdil bein Kodesh l'chol*" is said one should remove his shoes and not sit on a regular chair. One should then make the *beracha* on the Havdalah candle for his entire family before coming to come to shul for Maariv.

Havdalah on Motzei Shabbos

The *Shulchan Aruch*⁴¹ writes that the Havdalah ceremony is postponed until after *Tisha b'Av* (Sunday night), because a cup of wine may not be drunk on *Motzei Shabbos*. The *Mishna Berura*⁴² cautions that one must be careful to recite the prayer of "*attah chonanatanu*" in Shmoneh Esrei or at least say "*baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'chol*" before performing any *melacha*. Therefore, writes the *Mishna Berura*, "each person must remind his family to recite "*baruch ha'mavdil bein kodesh l'chol*" before performing *melacha* on *Motzei Shabbos*."

Besamim. The *Shulchan Aruch*⁴³ writes that *Besamin* is not used on *Motzei Shabbos*, because smelling the *Besamim* brings enjoyment to a person.

The Havdalah Candle. Although the Havdalah ceremony is postponed until Sunday, the *Shulchan Aruch*⁴⁴ writes that the *beracha* of "*Borei Meorei Ha'aish*" is recited over a candle on *Motzei Shabbos*. When the *beracha* of "*Borei Meorei Ha'aish*" is recited in Shul, one person recites the *beracha* for everyone in the congregation.⁴⁵ (It is preferable for the people listening to the *beracha* to sit while listening to this *beracha*.⁴⁶) If a woman cannot hear the *beracha* over the candle from a man she may recite it on her own.⁴⁷

The *Mishna Berura*⁴⁸ writes that the *beracha* on the candle should preferably be made before the *megilla* of Eicha is read, because during the recitation of Eicha we recite the verse "*He placed me in darkness*."

Havdalah on Sunday Night

The fast ends on Sunday night after *Tzais Ha'kochavim*. One may not eat until Havdalah is recited.⁴⁹ Havdalah on Sunday night consists of the following two *berachos*⁵⁰:

a) *Borei Pri Hagofen*- One makes the *beracha* of "*Borei Pri Hagofen*" on wine or grape juice, and the beverage may be drunk by an adult.⁵¹

b) *Hamavdil bein Kodesh L'chol*- The *beracha* of "*Hamavdil bein Kodesh L'chol*" is recited, as well. However:

- The introductory paragraphs to Havdalah ("*Hinei...*") are omitted.⁵²
- The *beracha* on *Besamim* (spices) is not made on Sunday night.⁵³ The *Besamim* is used on *Motzei Shabbos* in order to console a person upon losing the "extra *neshama*" that one receives on Shabbos. This reason only applies on *Motzei Shabbos* when the extra *neshama* leaves and is therefore not recited on Sunday night.⁵⁴
- The *beracha* on a candle is also not made on Sunday night (even if one did not recite the *beracha* on the candle on *Motzei Shabbos*).⁵⁵ The reason we recite a *beracha* on a candle is because on the first *Motzei Shabbos* of creation Hashem gave Adam haRishon the intellect to understand how to create a fire, therefore this *beracha* is only recited on *Motzei Shabbos*.⁵⁶

שיבנה בית המקדש במהרה בימינו!

The intention of this summary is to discuss common practical *shaylos*. One should consult a Rav concerning *p'sak halacha*.

²⁷ 552:23 ²⁸ Kovetz Mi'Bais Levi pg. 43, 14; Rav Simcha Bunim Cohen pg. 166 (see Yisroel v'Hazmanim, Bein Hametzarim, 210, who cites that this is the custom in Yerushalayim) ²⁹ sefer Darkei Chaim v'Shalom 470, Divrei Yoel zemiros Vol. 1:188 (see Yisroel v'Hazmanim, Bein Hametzarim, 210, who cites that this is the custom among many Chasidim) ³⁰ Kovetz Halachos pg. 65, Rav Simcha Bunim Cohen pg. 167 note 13 ³¹ See ibid. See also Mikadesh Yisroel (Bein Ha'Metzarim, dinei erev Tisha b'Av 34) where he writes that if someone "hides" the medication inside of food before Shabbos begins (or possibly even on Shabbos), it would be permissible to take the medication by eating the food. ³² Rema 552:10 *Mishna Berura* 552:24 ³³ *Mishna Berura* 552:24 ³⁴ Rav Simcha Bunim Cohen pg. 166 ³⁵ Rav Simcha Bunim Cohen pg. 169 ³⁶ [Shulchan Aruch and] Rema 553:2 *Mishna Berura* 553:6; See *Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso* 28:85 note 189 where he cites Rav Shlomo Zalman Aurbach who rules that one should say "*Baruch Hamavdil*" immediately at *Tzais Ha'kochavim* and then remove his shoes. However, other *poskim* rule (Kovetz Halachos pg. 283 note 14) that since the holiness of Shabbos continues until one says "*Baruch Hamavdil*" (because of *tosefes Shabbos*) one may continue to wear shoes until one this declaration is made and Shabbos is ended. ³⁷ Based on Rema 553:2 ³⁸ Based on Kovetz Halachos pg. 283 in a conversation with the author. ³⁹ Kovetz Halachos pg. 265. See also Biur Halacha 296:8 (d"l Lo yavdil) who has a doubt whether women may recite their own *beracha* since they may not be obligated to make the *beracha*. However, Rav Moshe Feinstein (C.M. 2:47:2) rules that a woman may recite this *beracha*; see also Tzitz Eliezer 14:43. ⁴⁰ *Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso* 28:85, Kovetz Halachos pg. 65 ⁴¹ *Shulchan Aruch* 556:1 *Mishna Berura* 556:1. ⁴² *Mishna Berura* 556:2 ⁴³ 556:1. See *Mishna Berura* 556:1. The *Sa'ar ha'Tzion* 556:1 brings a machlokes whether it is prohibited to smell besamim the entire *Tisha b'Av* or just on *Motzei Shabbos* when there is a particular pleasure of comforting a person for the *neshama yeseira* that leaves. ⁴⁴ 556:1 ⁴⁵ *Biur Halacha* 213:1 (Rav Doniel Neustadt Weekly Halacha) ⁴⁶ *Biur Halacha* ibid ⁴⁷ See *Biur Halacha* (296:8 d"l Lo) where he writes that he is unsure if a woman may recite a *beracha* over the Havdalah candle, and concludes that a woman should not recite this *beracha*. However, many *poskim* disagree and rule that a woman may recite this *beracha* [see Igros Moshe C.M. 2:47:2] Kovetz Halachos pg. 284 ⁴⁸ 556:1 ⁴⁹ See *Sha'arei Teshuva* 556:1 (Rav Simcha Bunim Cohen pg. 163) ⁵⁰ *Shulchan Aruch* 556:1 ⁵¹ *Mishna Berura* 556:3 ⁵² *Shmiras Shabbos k'hilchaso* Vol.2 pg. 284 ⁵³ *Shulchan Aruch* 556:1 ⁵⁴ *Mishna Berura* 556:5 ⁵⁵ *Shulchan Aruch* 556:1 ⁵⁶ *Mishna Berura* 556:4