Practical Modern-Day Controversies

In Hilchos You have heard the shaylos ... Now learn the issues & the opinions

Simchas
Yom Tov

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

The Mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov

The Shulchan Aruch¹ writes "One is obligated to be **b'Simcha** (happy) and to be **in good spirits** on Yom Tov, both him, his wife, his children and whomever is with him." The Mishna Berura³ explains that this is a mitzva d'Oraisa as the Torah⁴ states, - 'You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim.' The Shulchan Aruch⁵ writes that one has an obligation to ensure that not only is he b'Simcha on Yom Tov but that his wife, children and others in his household for Yom Tov, are b'Simcha on Yom Tov, as the Torah⁶ states "You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim – you, your sons and your daughters".

The Two parts of the mitzvah

The Shulchan Aruch indicates that there are really two parts to the mitzvah of Simcha on Yom Tov⁷:

- **1.** To be b'Simcha. To do acts which bring Simcha to a person, such as eating meat and drinking wine, as we will later discuss at length.
- 2. To be in good spirits. This means that one must work to be in a good mood over the duration of the entire Yom Tov and certainly to stay away from things which can bring him to pain and worry. The Rambam writes that "One may not be sad on Yom Tov; he must remove all his worry from his heart and focus on being happy." Thus, being sad on Yom Tov is prohibited mid'Oraisa, as Rav Zelig Ruvein Bengis would quip, "[people are not aware that] having a tiny amount of chametz on Pesach is only prohibited mid'Rabanan, but having a tiny amount of sadness or worry is prohibited mid'Oraisa!" The Vilna Goan would say that "the most difficult mitzva in the Torah to fulfill is the mitzvah to be happy on Yom Tov as one must remove all pain and worry from one's heart and be in a good mood the entire Yom Tov. Reb Chaim Volozhiner would testify about his Rebbe, the Vilna Goan, that "His happiness and his enjoyment of Hashem on Yom Tov was astounding and was in accordance with what our Torah commands us." As we mentioned, one has an obligation to ensure that not only is he in good spirits on Yom Tov but that his family is in good spirits as well and to ensure that they are not in pain or worried. "Is a good work was a supplied to the same that they are not in pain or worried."

How do we fulfill the mitzva to be b'Simcha?

The Shulchan Aruch¹⁴ asks "How do we fulfill the mitzvah of *Simcha*?" Meaning, how does one fulfill the first aspect of this mitzva to perform actions which bring one to "be *b'simcha*". He explains that for each person it is different, as the Gemara¹⁵ states "Men fulfill this mitzvah with what is fit for them and women [fulfill this mitzvah] with what is fit for them" [and children for what is fit for them¹⁶], as we will soon explain:

For men: Drinking wine and eating meat

The Gemara¹⁷ writes that "In the times of the Bais Hamikdash, men would fulfill the mitzvah of *Simchas Yom Tov* by eating the meat of the *korban shelamim*, as the verse¹⁸ states 'You shall bring a *korban shelamim* and eat it there and be happy in front of Hashem.' But nowadays when we do not have the Bais Hamikdash, men fulfill this mitzvah by drinking wine, as the verse¹⁹ states 'wine makes happy the heart of a man'."

Drinking wine. At each meal that one drinks wine he fulfills this mitzvah d'Oraisa.²⁰ Therefore, one must be careful to drink wine at each meal and to give wine to all (the men²¹) at his Seuda.²² Rav Moshe Feinstein²³ ruled that to fulfill this mitzvah one must specifically drink wine and does not fulfill the mitzvah with grape juice.²⁴ One should try to drink a reviis of wine at the meal²⁵ (however some²⁶ rule that even by drinking a

little bit of wine one fulfills this mitzvah). One who dislikes wine does not need to drink wine on Yom Tov since it does not bring him Simcha.²⁷

Eating meat. The Rambam²⁸ understands that even nowadays one must also eat meat as well, and the intention of the Gemara was to state that nowadays the primary *Simcha* shifted to wine, but certainly there is still an obligation to eat meat on Yom Tov.²⁹ However, the Shulchan Aruch³⁰ disagrees and states that the Gemara indicates that nowadays, when there is no *korban shelamim*, a man is obligated only to drink wine on Yom Tov. Mishna Berura³¹ writes that therefore although there is no obligation to eat meat on Yom Tov there is still a mitzvah to eat [a k'zayis³² of] meat on Yom Tov since we find that meat does bring *Simcha*.

Chicken. The Rambam³³ writes that one does not fulfill the mitzvah [of *Shalmei Simcha*, which are extra *karbanos* that are brought on Yom Tov to eat for extra *Simcha*,] with chicken or bread, because only meat brings one happiness. Thus, some poskim³⁴ rule that one must specifically eat meat on Yom Tov. However, others write that the Rambam was writing this halacha specifically for the requirements of *Shalmei Simcha* but regarding the mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov one may use chicken as well since there is at least some level of *Simcha* which is attained by eating chicken.³⁵ Rav Shmuel Wosner³⁶ writes that the custom seems to be that on Yom Tov one does not need to specifically eat specifically meat but may eat chicken as well. On the other hand, Rav Moshe Feinstein³⁷ ruled that to fulfill the mitzvah of Simcha one must eat meat and does not fulfill the mitzvah with chicken.

Simcha through other means. The Shagas Aryeh³⁸ writes that although the Gemara states that optimal way to bring *Simcha* is through drinking wine [and eating meat], one should add to his *Simcha* of Yom Tov in any way that he can. Similarly, the Shulchan Aruch HaRav³⁹ writes that "we must [also] have other forms of Simcha as well and for this reason the custom on Yom Tov is to have an abundance of food and to dress in nicer clothing - more than one has even on Shabbos [because on Shabbos one is not obligated in *Simcha*⁴⁰]. Thus, one fulfills the mitzvah of Simcha by:

- Taking an enjoyable walk on Yom Tov.⁴¹
- The Ramban⁴² writes that when one recites Hallel on Yom Tov he fulfills a mitzva d'Oraisa since it brings a Jew to Simcha and thus fulfills the mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov.⁴³
- The Shagas Aryeh⁴⁴ writes that "When a man learns Torah on Yom Tov, he fulfills this mitzva since doing so brings him happiness as he knows that he is toiling in Hashem's Torah and that this is the most precious mitzvah which is equivalent to all the other *mitzvos* in the eyes of Hashem."

For women: New Clothing

The Torah⁴⁶ states that "You shall be happy – you and your house(hold) [i.e., your wife⁴⁷]," this teaches that there is an obligation to ensure that one's wife is b'Simcha on Yom Tov.⁴⁸ The Shulchan Aruch⁴⁹ writes "How does one bring Simcha to women? One should buy for them clothing and jewelry, based on one's income." The Mishna Berura⁵⁰ adds that if one cannot afford to buy his wife new clothing, he should at least buy her new shoes. Meaning, that the [main] way that one brings Simcha to a woman is by buying new clothing and not through meat and wine [as these generally do not bring Simcha to a woman⁵¹]. ⁵² The Shulchan Aruch⁵³ explains that this is an obligation which falls on the husband to bring Simcha to his wife.⁵⁴ Some poskim⁵⁵ rule that a woman cannot be mochel (forgive) this obligation.⁵⁶

1 529-2 citing the Rambam in Hilchos Yom Tov 6:17 2 Rosh Hashama. The Mishna Berura (597:1) adds that this applies to the Yom Tov of Rosh Hashama as well, even though it is a time of judgment it is still called a Chag, as the Torsh states 'bokesh fyom Chageanu.' 3 529:15 4
Devarim 16:14 5 529-2 based on the German Rosh Hashama 6b where there is a dispute whether this is an obligation on the husband or an obligation on the Wish hashama. The Mishna Berura (529:18) adds that there is also an obligation on the woman herself to ensure that she has Simchas Yom Tov. Although this is a mitzee seeth she hazmam gramm (which women are normally exempt from) since this is a mitzee which will bring it with the she hashama. The Mishna Berura (529:18) adds that there is also an obligation on the woman herself to ensure that she has Simchas Yom Tov. Although this is a mitzee seeth she hazmam gramm (which women are normally exempt from) since this is a mixtured which is related to Yom Tov, which women are also obligated in, they are obligated in finite and the she hazmam gramm (which women are normally exempt from) since this is a mixtured which is related to Yom Tov, which women are also obligated in, they are obligated in finite and the she hazmam gramm (which women are also obligated in the property of t

Fulfilling a woman's Simchas Yom Tov with other items. The poskim discuss whether one can fulfill this mitzvah of ensuring that his wife is *b'Simcha* only with clothing and jewelry or with other items as well. Some poskim⁵⁷ rule that it is clear from the Gemara that only clothing and jewelry bring true Simcha to a woman. However, others⁵⁸ rule that buying any item that will bring her happiness fulfills this mitzvah. For example, according to these poskim buying a new dish or tablecloth to enhance the Yom Tov meal fulfills the mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov if it brings happiness to one's wife.⁵⁹ Similarly, on the Yom Tov of Shavuos (where the wife bought new clothing recently on the Yom Tov of Pesach) one may buy flowers to enhance the table.⁶⁰ [However, all agree that the *ideal* way to bring *Simcha* to one's wife is by buying new clothing or jewelry, as the Gemara states, but these opinions rule that *b'dieved* one can also fulfill this mitzvah in other ways which bring Simcha (this is especially true in situations where a wife does not need new clothing or jewelry).⁶¹]

Buying new clothing or jewelry every Yom Tov. The *poskim* discuss whether there is an obligation to buy new clothing or jewelry every Yom Tov if one's wife already has clothing and jewelry for Yom Tov from previous *Yomim Tovim*. To understand this, it is important to discuss how purchasing new clothing for Yom Tov brings happiness to one's wife:

I. Rav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv⁶² ruled that what brings a wife happiness is not just that she has new clothing but knowing that her husband took the interest to ensure that she has clothing for Yom Tov. The Shulchan Aruch⁶³ states that "*buying* a woman clothing or jewelry brings them happiness," which indicates that the fact that the husband ensured that his wife has new clothing for Yom Tov brings his wife happiness. [The husband does not need to be the one who actually purchases the new clothing, but it is sufficient that he is concerned for his wife to have new clothing or jewelry for Yom Tov and ensures that she purchases it.⁶⁴] Accordingly, Rav Elyashiv⁶⁵ rules that even if a wife has clothing from previous Yomim Tovim the husband must buy new clothing.⁶⁶ [According to the poskim cited earlier, one may fulfill the mitzvah by purchasing a new dish or other items which will bring his wife Simcha on Yom Tov.⁶⁷]

2. Other poskim⁶⁸ rule that what brings a woman happiness on Yom Tov is actually wearing nice clothing on Yom Tov. Therefore, so long as a woman has special clothing for Yom Tov, such as from a different Yom Tov, it is sufficient to fulfill this mitzvah.⁶⁹ However, these clothing must be relatively new that they still bring her *Simcha* by wearing it.⁷⁰

For children: Candies and Treats

As we mentioned, the Torah⁷¹ states "You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim – you, your sons and your daughters". The "Shulchan Aruch⁷² writes that "one must ensure that his children are b'Simcha on Yom Tov, and that this is done by giving them roasted grains and nuts."⁷³ Nowadays, when children are not excited by roasted grains and nuts, one can fulfill this obligation with candies and other treats.⁷⁴ This obligation applies to every day of Yom Tov, as one must provide the Simcha for one's children each day of Yom Tov [just as one must have Simcha for himself (i.e., eating meat and drinking wine) each day of Yom Tov].⁷⁵

Children over bar/bas mitzvah

The Torah⁷⁶ states "You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim – you, your sons and your daughters and your servant and maidservant". The Shulchan Aruch⁷⁷ explains that the Torah is teaching us that "On Yom Tov, one must ensure that his wife, sons, daughters and all those who are with him (i.e., in his household⁷⁸) are also b'Simcha."⁷⁹ Meaning, just as one is responsible to provide Simchas Yom Tov for one's servants and maidservants who are part of his household (as they are under his care throughout there year), so too one must provide Simcha all those who are part of his household. This would include one's sons and daughters who live in his home the entire year and are under his care, even if they are over bar/bas mitzvah.⁸⁰

Providing for the Poor

The Torah⁸¹ states "You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim – you, your sons and your daughters and your servant and maidservant – and **the Levi, convert, orphan and widow** who are in your gates." Thus the Shulchan Aruch⁸² writes that [this verse teaches us that⁸³] one is obligated to feed the poor people [of his city on Yom Tov].⁸⁴ The Mishna Berura⁸⁵ writes sharply that "[The Rambam states that] one who closes his doors so that he and his family can eat and drink but does not provide food to the poor people outside, this is not a *Simcha* of mitzvah but a *Simcha* for one's stomach! Such *Simcha* is an embarrassment to them!" In fact, the Ksav Sofer⁸⁶ writes that "this Rambam infers that if one does not provide food for the poor, he does not fulfill his own obligation of *Simchas Yom Tov*, as this is not

considered *Simchas Yom Tov* but *Simcha* of his stomach! Thus, there is a mitzva to invite needy people to one's Yom Tov meal as this way one ensures that he fulfills the mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov."87

The Mishna Berura continues, "The Zohar ha'Kadosh also extensively expounds upon the punishment that one receives for not providing food for the poor people on Yom Tov, G-d forbid. This obligation is well known to the Jewish people and thus it is uncommon for there remain poor people who do not have food for their Yom Tov meals. But, what about the downtrodden people in the city who are embarrassed to stretch out their hands to ask for food? Therefore, in some communities there are understanding people who go before Yom Tov to collect money from the wealthy people to collect for these downtrodden people. Fortunate are these people who pay attention to this as they are bringing merit upon themselves and also bring merit [and shield] the rest of the city." Rashi⁸⁸ writes that "[Hakadosh Baruch Hu says] 'My four people (the Levi, the convert, the orphan and the widow) are corresponding to your four people (your sons, your daughters, your slaves and your maidservants). If you make My people happy then I will make your people happy'."⁸⁹

The correct way to be b'Simcha of Yom Tov

The Medrash⁹⁰ writes:

Although the Torah commands us to be *b'Simcha* on Yom Tov, we would not know the correct way to do so - should one be happy with the day of Yom Tov or with *Hakadosh Baruch Hu*? Shlomo Hamelech [therefore] came along and wrote⁹!: "We will rejoice and be happy **in You**". You – with *Hakadosh Baruch Hu*; You – with your salvation; You – with Your Torah; You – with [our] fear of You."⁹²

Rabbeinu Yona⁹³ explains this Medrash as follows: The main happiness is not for the Yom Tov that we celebrate, but for Hashem – to publicize the great and awesome deeds that He did for us."

Meaning that there are two reasons we rejoice on Yom Tov:

-) You with Hakadosh Baruch Hu; You with your salvation. We rejoice and are happy not just for the miracles which occurred for us, but also for the fact that they were performed by Hakadosh Baruch Hu for us and we publicize His greatness.⁹⁴
- You with Your Torah; You with [our] fear of You. We rejoice and are happy not just for the miracles which occurred for us, but also for the fact that they brought us closer to His Torah and His service.⁹⁵

This is illustrated by the following story%: A man approached Rav Elazar Menachem Shach on erev Yom Tov and asked him how he could fulfill the mitzvah of Simchas Yom Tov properly? Rav Shch responded that he would find the answer to his question when he recited Kiddush that night. The man returned the next day and stated that he unfortunately did not find the answer to his question in Kiddush. Rav Shach exclaimed that in Kiddush we state 'You chose us from all the nations and elevated us from all languages,' and when one recites this he should dance and be filled with happiness.

The Shulchan Aruch⁹⁷ writes this clearly as well: "[Although] one must eat and drink and be happy on Yom Tov, he should not indulge himself in a frivolous and lighthearted manner [and think to himself that the more he is happy on these days the more he fulfills the mitzvah⁹⁸], because frivolousness is not happiness. We are only commanded to have Simcha which has within it service of Hashem." ⁹⁹ The Mishna Berura¹⁰⁰ adds that it is the way of Chasidim, who constantly have Hashem in front of their eyes, that during their Simcha they praise Hashem more and more as He has brought them to this Simcha."¹⁰¹

חצי לה' וחצי לכם

The Torah writes two verses regarding how one should spend his Yom Tov. In one verse 102 it states that "It should be a Yom Tov for Hashem," and in another verse 103 it states that "It should be a Yom Tov for you." The Gemara 104 cites the opinion of Rav Yehoshua who reconciles these verses as follows: "The mitzvah on Yom Tov is to split the day: Half the day should be spent in the Bais Medrash (i.e., learning Torah and davening 105) and half the day should be spent for eating and drinking." The Shulchan Aruch 106 follows this opinion.

The Shagas Aryeh¹⁰⁷ explains as follows:

The Torah obligates us to be happy on Yom Tov, as the verse¹⁰⁸ states, י משמחת בחגר - 'You shall be happy on your Yomim Tovim.' This Gemara is teaching us that this happiness must be split: half of Yom Tov one must make his physical body happy and half of Yom Tov one must make his spiritual neshama happy through learning Torah (and davening). 109 However, as we

The poor, the doctained training for an (and davening). If the poor is not comment to simply (level filter) of the poor is not comment to simply (level filter) of the poor is not comment to the poor is not comm