Practical Modern-Day Controversies

In Hilchos You have heard the shaylos ... Now learn the issues & the opinions

The Halachos and Minhagim of

Lighting the

Chanukah

Menorah

A summary of the weekly Wednesday night shiur by Rabbi Shmuel Stein at the Miami Beach Community Kollel / To receive a copy send an email to InHilchosShabbos@gmail.com

Although the mitzvah to light the Chanukah Menorah is only *mid'Rabanan* it is an important mitzvah as the Rambam¹ writes "the mitzvah of lighting the Chanukah Menorah is exceedingly precious. One must be careful to perform this mitzvah [properly], because through this mitzvah one publicizes the miracle of Chanukah and gives praises and thanks to Hashem for the miracles which He performs for us. Even if someone does not have money, he must sell even his shirt to buy oil for the Chanukah Menorah." The Gemara² states that someone who is careful to perform the mitzvah of lighting the Chanukah Menorah properly will merit to have sons [and son in laws³] who are *talmidei Chachamim*. In this chapter we will discuss the *halachos* and *minhagim* which are involved in this special mitzvah.⁴

I) The proper Kavana when lighting the Menorah

The Mishna Berura⁵ writes that "the Chanukah Menorah is lit each night of Chanukah [once it is dark⁶] to publicize the miracles of Chanukah." Since the miracle of Chanukah involved finding the jug of oil used to light the Menorah, we light the Menorah to remember the miracle that occurred. Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach⁸ explains that "Lighting the Menorah is an act of thanks to Hashem which should evoke feelings of thanksgiving towards Hashem for the miracles which He performed for us. Someone who lights the Menorah and does not have feelings of gratitude to Hashem is missing the most integral part of the mitzvoh of lightning the Menorah." Before lighting the Chanukah Menorah, we recite the beracha of "She'asah nisim la'avosainu" (He performed miracles for our forefathers), to remind ourselves that the purpose of lighting the Menorah is to evoke feelings of thanksgiving to Hashem for these miracles.

2) A Nice Menorah

The Mishna Berura¹⁰ writes that "it is written the sefarim, that it is appropriate to exert oneself to the best of his abilities to ensure that he has a beautiful Chanukah Menorah." The Be'er Heitiv¹¹ adds that someone who can afford to use a silver Menorah should do so.¹²

3) The oil for the Menorah

The Shulchan Aruch¹³ writes that one may use all types of oils and wicks for lightning the Chanukah Menorah. However, the Rema¹⁴ adds that it is preferrable to use olive oil for lighting the Menorah. The Mishnah Berura¹⁵ explains, since the miracle of Chanukah occurred through a jug of olive oil, which was found and lit in the *Bais Ha'mikdash*, it is preferable to use olive oil for the mitzva of lighting the Menorah. However, the Rema¹⁶ writes, "if olive oil is not available one should use oil which produces a flame that is pure and clean. In our countries the custom is to use wax candles for the Menorah because its flame is just as clear as the flame which oil produces."¹⁷

I. Congealed oil

The Rav Shmuel Wosner¹⁸ writes "Using congealed oil for the Chanukah Menorah is not the preferred manner of fulfilling the mitzvah since congealed oil was not valid for the Menorah of the Bais Hamikdash. Congealed oil does not have the status of a liquid¹⁹ and thus does not resemble the oil found in the Bais Hamikdash." Nevertheless, the majority of poskim²⁰ permit using congealed oil as the preferred method of fulfilling the mitzvah of lighting the Menorah. They argue that the oil used for the Chanukah Menorah does not need to entirely replicate the oil which was found in the Bais Hamikdash, rather any olive oil is sufficient to fulfill the preferred method of fulfilling the mitzvah. For example, one does not need to use olive oil which was produced from the first pressing of the olive as it was produced for the Menorah of the Bais Hamikdash,²¹ since any olive oil sufficiently resembles the oil used in the Bais Hamikdash.²²

2. Ready-made Menorah

There are *neiros* which one can purchase which contain a glass cup that is ready-made with oil and wicks and are ready to be lit. Rav Shmuel Kamenetsky²³ ruled that "it is obvious that if the ready-made cups will light better and brighter than homemade cups it is preferable to use the ready-made cups for the Chanukah Menorah. This is clear from the following ruling of the Rema²⁴:

If one does not have olive oil available to use for the Menorah, the custom is to use wax candles for the Menorah since they produce a nice and bright light.

Hence, we see that the custom was to use wax candles since they produced a bright light even though one does not need to exert himself to prepare the candles." Kovetz Halachos²⁵ writes "It is common to hear people say that 'There is a great *Inyan* to prepare one's own wicks for the Chanukah Menorah,' but it is not clear where the source for this is. In fact, when the Gemara²⁶ states that 'Someone who is careful to fulfill the mitzva of lighting the candles will merit sons who are *talmidei Chachamim*,' the Tur²⁷ explains that this means that one must ensure that the light burn nicely. Hence, we do not have a source which states that there is an *Inyan* to prepare one's own wicks for the Chanukah Menorah."²⁸

3. Oil without a hechsher

The poskim²⁹ write that oil which is not kosher to be eaten (e.g., it mixed with oil from a non-kosher animal or from *Orlah*) may still be used for the Chanukah Menorah. Nevertheless, Kovetz Halachos³⁰ writes that "it is worthy to buy olive oil with a hechsher which states that the oil consists of 100% olive oil due to the concern that it is not uncommon for companies to mix other types of oils into the bottle olive oil and state that it is 'olive oil' thereby taking away the hiddur of using olive oil."

4. Electric Menorah

The poskim rule³¹ that one does not fulfill the mitzvah of lighting the Chanukah Menorah with electric lights. They give several reasons why using an electric Menorah does not fulfill the mitzva.

a. It does not resemble the Menorah of the Bais Ha'mkidash

Since an electric Menorah does not consist of oil or wicks, it does not at all resemble the Menorah which was lit in the *Bais Ha'mikdash*.³² Although a Chanukah Menorah does not need to replicate the Menorah which was in the *Bais Ha'mikdash*, for example, there is no *requirement* to use olive oil to light the Chanukah Menorah, but an electric Menorah does not at all resemble the Menorah of the *Bais Ha'mikdash* since it does not consist of oil or a wick, and therefore it may not be used to fulfill the mitzva.³³

b. All the oil must be in the Menorah at the time of the lighting

The Shulchan Aruch³⁴ rules that all the oil must be in the Menorah at the time when it is lit. Meaning, at the time of the lighting the Menorah must contain enough oil to last for a half an hour, and one may not add additional oil after the Menorah has already been lit. Accordingly, using and electric Menorah is problematic since there is not enough electricity present at the time that the Menorah is lit to last for a half an hour.³⁵

Accordingly, because of these reasons, the *poskim* rule that one should not use an electric Menorah to fulfill the mitzva of lighting the Menorah. If someone is in a situation where he cannot use oil or candles to light the Menorah (i.e., in a hospital or airplane) he should consult a Rav regarding fulfilling the mitzvah with the lighting of his family done in his home or by appointing a *Shaliach* (agent) to light a Menorah on his behalf, or possibly using an electric Menorah in such a situation.³⁶

I Chanuka 4:12 2 Shabbos 23b 3 Rashi, Shabbos 23b d"h nafik minoyhu 4 Eating before lighting the Chanukah Menorah. The Mishna Berura (672:10) writes that once the time to light the Menorah arrives, one may not learn before lighting the Menorah and certainly one may store eating or learning even if he began in a permissible way (Plishna Berura (132:34) writes that tonce it reaches half an hour before the time to light, the Menorah one may not eat. However, the Shulchan Aruch (232:3) writes that this prohibition applies only to eating bread or to pas haba b'kisnin which one is koveyah seuda on [more than a k'beitza (Pishna Berura 232:34; 286:8). [It is questionable whether one may act at full action of the began in a permissible way (Plishna Berura 232:34; 286:8). [It is questionable whether one may act at full writes that one is koveyah seuda on [more than a k'beitza of pas haba b'kisnin) (see Mekadesh Yisroel siman 21).] Yet, the Shulchan Aruch (ibid) writes that one may have a snack, such as fruits (or less than a k'beitza of pas haba b'kisnin) (see Mekadesh Yisroel siman 21). In a time of need, where one will be lighting later and wishes to eat a meal or is at a Chanukah mesiba and wishes to eat before lighting the Menorah, he may set an alarm to remind him to light the Menorah and then eat the meal (Shiurei Halacha, Chanukah p. 355). Children may eat before lighting the Menorah (Mekadesh Yisroel, siman 21). Some say that a woman who is waiting for her husband to arrive home may be lenient as well and eat before lighting the Menorah since her husband is not home it is as if it is not the time for her to perform he mitzra (Ashrei Ish 32:5; Kovetz m'Bais Levi vol. 10, p. 22; Mekadesh Yisroel 215). However, others write that a woman too should not eat a meal before her husband comes home and lights the Menorah (Halichos Shlomo 16:3). B'tzel ha'Chachma (4:58) writes that although m'likar ha'din a woman may eat a meal will see he is waiting for her husband to come home to light, the custom is that women refrain fr

4) The correct way to set up and light one's Menorah

The Shulchan Aruch³⁷ discusses the correct way to set up and light one's Chanukah Menorah each night:

Setting up one's Menorah each night

He³⁸ writes that one should set up his Menorah in the following manner: On the first night of Chanukah, one should place the candle which will be lit, at the right side of the Menorah. On the second night of Chanukah, a second candle is added and is placed on the left side of the first candle. Subsequently, on the rest of the nights of Chanukah, an additional candle is added towards the left of the Menorah. [The reason for this will be explained in the next paragraph.]

Lighting the Menorah

The Shulchan Aruch³⁹ writes that when lighting the Menorah, one should always begin by lighting the new candle which was added to the Menorah that night. Since the newly added candle demonstrates that the miracle of Chanukah lasted another day, we begin by lighting the newly added candle.⁴⁰ After the first candle is lit, we continue to light the remaining candles by proceeding *towards the right* of the Menorah. *Chazal* teach that "whenever one turns, he should *turn towards the right*," since the right side represents the *middah* of *Chesed* (mercy) and turning to the right strengthens this *middah*.⁴¹ Therefore, when one lights the Menorah, he begins on the left side of the Menorah (i.e., his left side) and continues towards the right of the Menorah.⁴²

[Based on this, the Shulchan Aruch⁴³ writes that one should set up the candles each night by starting on the left side of the Menorah, as we discussed above. Since one should, a) begin by lighting the newly added candle, and b) proceed towards the right, this can be accomplished only if one sets up the candles on the left of the Menorah, this way he can first light the newly added candle on the left side and then continue towards the right.]

Standing to the left of the Menorah when lighting

The Mishna Berura⁴⁴ writes that when one lights the Menorah, he should stand slightly towards the left of the Menorah so that he will be positioned next to the newly added candle which he will light first. This way he does not need to pass over the other candles which will not be lit first as the principle of ein ma'avirin al ha'mitzvos states that one should not pass over a mitzva.

Holding one's hand at the candle until its fully lit

The Mishna Berura⁴⁵ writes that when one lights the Menorah, he should leave the candle by the wick until most of the wick (which will be lit) has begun to light. This is done to ensure that the flame of the candle is burning bright immediately when he removes his hand just as was done in the Bais Hamikdash.⁴⁶ *B'dieved*, if one did not leave the candle by the wick until it has begun to light, he still fulfills the mitzvah.⁴⁷

5) The Shamesh (the additional candle)

The Shulchan Aruch⁴⁸ writes that one may not use the light of the Chanukah Menorah for one's own benefit. As we say in *ha'Neiros ha'lalu* "and we do not have permission to use the flame of the Menorah, rather we may only look at them". The reason one may not use the light of the Menorah is so that it is recognizable that the Menorah is being lit for the mitzvah and to publicize the miracle of Chanukah, and not for one's personal use.⁴⁹

The Shamesh

The Shulchan Aruch⁵⁰ writes that "the custom is to light an additional candle (known as the *Shamesh*) so that if one uses the light of the candles for his personal usage, he will use the light of additional candle and not the light of the Menorah."⁵¹ The Rema⁵² adds that the *Shamesh* should be longer (or raised higher) than the other candles so that if he uses the light, he will be benefiting from the light of the *Shamesh* which is raised higher and not from the light of the other candles.⁵³

The need for a Shamesh nowadays

The Shulchan Aruch⁵⁴ writes that "if one has a torch [in the room where the Menorah is lit], he does not need to light a *Shamash*, because it is obvious that he is benefiting from the light of the torch and not from the light of the Menorah. Similarly, *Poskim*⁵⁵ rule that nowadays when our homes are fully illuminated with electric lights, one does not need to light a *Shamesh*, because it is obvious that he is benefiting from the

electricity and not from the light of the Menorah. Nevertheless, the custom of lighting a Shamesh is done even nowadays. 56

6) Ha'neiros Ha'lalu

The Shulchan Aruch⁵⁷ writes that after one lights the Menorah, he recites the song of "ha'Neiros ha'lalu." We mentioned earlier that this song reminds us that the purpose of lighting the Menorah is to evoke feelings of praise and thanks to Hashem for the miracle of Chanukah. Additionally, the Mishna Berura⁵⁸ explains that the 36 words in this song correspond to the 36 candles which are lit over Chanukah. Furthermore, the two words of ha'neiros ha'lalu have eight letters corresponding to the eight days of Chanukah.

The Mishna Berura⁵⁹ writes one should begin to recite *ha'Nerios ha'lalu* immediately after lightning the first candle of the Menorah.⁶⁰ Once a person has lit the first candle, he has fulfilled his obligation of lighting the Menorah, as all the other candles are lit only as *mehadrin* (to beautify the mitzvah). Therefore, once the first candle is lit, and one's obligation has been fulfilled, he recites *ha'Neiros ha'lalu* while lighting the remaining candles.

7) Looking at the flames of the Menorah

The Shev Yaakov⁶¹ writes that "although the main part of the mitzva is lighting the Menorah, there is also a mitzva to ensure that one looks at the flames of the Menorah. This is clear from the words of *Haneiros Halalu* which states that 'we may not use [the light of the candles], but we may only look at them,' which indicates that there is a mitzva to look at the flames of the candles." Accordingly, one should try to ensure that his entire family is present at the lighting of the Menorah and look (at least briefly) at the candles of the Menorah. ⁶³

Rav Moshe Feinstein⁶⁴ writes that one does not need to look at the flames of the Menorah for the entire half-an-hour which the Menorah must remain lit, rather it is sufficient to merely glance once at the Chanukah candles. However, many poskim⁶⁵ write that one should try to remain by the Menorah and look at its flames for the entire half an hour that it must remain lit. The Mekor Chaim⁶⁶ writes that "the main part of the mitzva is to wait around by the candles of the Menorah for a half an hour and to look at them and rejoice with them... It is not sufficient to merely light the candles and leave to another place."67 Sefer Mekadesh Yisroel68 writes that "It is well known that many of the tzadikim of the generations would look at the neiros of the Menorah for a half an hour. Yet, on the other hand, there were many gedolim, primarily from the leaders of Lithuania, who immediately after lighting the Menorah [and briefly looking at the candles] would leave to another place to learn Torah as their intention was surely to absorb the holiness of the days through the light of the holy Torah. Thus, all hearts should seek out the way which will bring them close to Hashem.' According to all opinions one should at least remain by the Menorah and look at its flames for at least a brief amount of time before leaving.

8) Disposing of the used Chanukah oil

The Shulchan Aruch⁶⁹ writes that "the leftover oil [and wicks⁷⁰] which were used for the Menorah⁷¹ should be burned." This means that when one disposes of the remaining oil and wicks, he may not dispose of them in a disrespectful manner since they were designated for a mitzvah, but they must be burnt.⁷² The *poskim*⁷³ write that the intention of the Shulchan Aruch is not that one must specifically to burn the leftover oil and wicks but they may be disposed of in any manner which is respectful, for example:

- One may spill the leftover oil into a sink.
- One may wrap the leftover wicks in a plastic bag before throwing them into the garbage.

Disposing of the glass cups and disposable Menorah

The glass cups which were used for the light the Menorah may be disposed of in any manner (i.e., even thrown directly in the garbage), since they were not directly used to perform the mitzvah.⁷⁴ Therefore, only the oil and wicks may not be thrown out since they were used to create the actual flame of the Menorah. Nevertheless, it is still preferable to wrap the glass cups in a plastic bag before throwing them out.⁷⁵